

Teachers' Perception towards Professional Development and HRM Practices at Higher Education Institutions of Pakistan

Ali Murtaza Shah

Faculty of Education, Lasbela University of Agriculture, Water and Marine Sciences, Uthal

Tehseen Anjum

Department of Education, Mir Chakar Khan Rind University, Sibi, Balochistan

Mahnaz Aslam

Department of Education, University of Turbat, Kech

Zafar Iqbal Yousufzai

Ph. D (Education) Scholar, Department of Education, Alhamd Islamic University, Islamabad

Syed Mirsyed

Ph. D (Education) Scholar, University of Karachi

Atiqur Rehman

Department of Economics, Lasbela University of Agriculture, Water and Marine Sciences, Uthal

Corresponding author mail id : alimurtazashah91@gmail.com

Received date: 25th January 2022

Revised date: 08th March 2022

Accepted date: 14th April 2022

Abstract: Teachers' professional development at higher education institution is most important factor and core aspect for teachers' career growth & development and HRM practices at higher education institutions for teachers' professional development play key role for upbringing the quality education & professional platform for graduates & under graduates students. This study examined the perception of teachers towards teachers' professional development and HRM practices for teachers' professional development at higher education institution of Pakistan through qualitative method and phenomenological design. Data was collected through semi structured interviews by convenience sampling from the 30 teachers of higher education institutions of Pakistan & documents analysis of HRM policy. Study found that there is a grave need and demand of teachers' professional development and teachers' misfit in classroom teaching, poor in classroom instructions, rude and abrupt classroom behavior with students, invalid and void practices in classroom assessment. There are meager number of scholarship slots, inadequate trainings and development courses & programs and institutional restriction in permission for professional development courses and higher education study. Furthermore explored that teachers are not financially supported and grant for higher studies (Master, M.phil & PhD), institution only provides NOC and study leave which are not sufficient to encourage the teachers professional development & higher education.

Keywords: Teachers, Professional Development, HRM Practices & Higher Education Institution

Teachers' Perception towards Professional Development and HRM Practices at Higher Education Institutions of Pakistan

Introduction

Professional development of teachers is concurrent issue of higher educational institution generally and particularly at higher education institutions. Mostly teachers perceived that professional development is fundament aspect of career growth; there has been a dire need and demand of skills development and professional development at higher education institutions of Pakistan. Most of teachers are not professionally developed therefore they cannot teach effectively and efficiently to maintain the quality education in the institution. Teacher perceived that majority of teachers are lacking pedagogical methods and assessment strategies and their skills do not meet the standards of higher education institutions and higher education commission Pakistan practices. Perception of teachers towards professional development is unsatisfactory toward the HRM role and performance of institution regarding the quality education. Professional development programs and courses are insufficient for the teacher to cater their professional needs and meet the desired professional satisfaction by pertaining this HRM department is lacking the leadership potential to comprehend the perception of teachers' for professional development. Professional development programs and practices alter the traditional approach of teachers, teaching methodology and attitude of teachers to the students and their performance (Uranga, 1995). Professional development is the central aspect to modify the behavior of the teachers. Professional development practices provide the advanced tactics, strategies, methods and skills (Barnard, 2004). Thakral, (2011) focused that professional development practices are the best opportunity to flourish the new skills of teacher to meet the demand and perception of learning and its highly beneficial for the institution to review the practices of professional development according to the intervention of time. Teachers' perception is ambiguous toward the credibility of management and its practices towards professional development it creates anxiety and uncertainty for their career and professional success. The purpose of this study investigates the perception of university teacher toward practices & policies of human resources department to meet expectation of teachers to achieve the desired professional development for their career inclination.

Effective management understands the needs, demands, issues and challenges of the teachers researches and literature reviews focus on the features and working conditions compel them to drive away from the job (Scafidi, Sjoquist, & Stinebrickner, 2005). Teachers play essential role to contribute their performance for the success of an organization. Organizations are fully experienced about the effectiveness of recruitment and development of teachers thought their career. Establish the support and retained the ratio of teachers to maintain the quality education and effective teaching learning environment. Professional development is mandatory for the teachers to flourish their skills and abilities in assigned field. Employees have high expectation from their institution to fulfill the need and necessity of livelihood (Billingsley, Carlson, & Klein, 2004; Burns & Lawrie, 2015). Abandon studies have been conducted across the globe to investigate and analyze the perception of teachers about professional development and high expectation toward the management. Teachers' perception towards practices and policy of development is uncertain and ambiguous. Teachers encounter various challenges regarding the strategies of institution they are not provided NOCs, poor practices of skill development programs in public sector universities. It is the fundamental right of teachers to make them updated with advances skills according to need of time and demand (Evers, van der Heijden, Kreijns, & Vermeulen, 2015). Success and failure of institution depends upon the effectiveness and efficiency of teachers and well planned developmental strategies & plans for the teachers in order to improve the classroom activities respectively and enhance the professional performance of teachers (Guskey & Yoon, 2009). There are various effective study which believe that successful teaching has always need of sustainable professional grooming in order to meet the standers of teaching learning process.

Various researchers and scholars have developed the teachers professional development to maximize the performance of teachers it is comprised of effective contents, inquiry bases learning, collaborative learning and integrated with curriculum and policy of the government (Garet, Porter, Desimone, Birman, & Yoon,

2001). Organization of Economic Cooperation & Development has conducted a survey (TALIS) on professional development of teachers from 34 countries across the World it focused on the teacher working conditions, learning environment and role leadership for the professional development of teachers. TALIS largely reflected the perceptions of teacher and their expectations toward human resources management department. This program focused on different professional developmental opportunities and programs for the teachers which includes the induction training and skill development courses. This study investigates the expertise and skill development of teachers and their perception towards their professional inclination and satisfaction toward the responsibility of administration. This study indicated the teachers need of professional development and perception toward their institutions. Organizations provide chance and opportunity to comprehension barriers and dealing encouragement to achieve the desired objectives of professional development. The finding of this study clearly communicates the performance and perception towards the sincere efforts of the management to exceed and enhance the level of their competency and knowledge related to particular domain (Meissel, Parr, & Timperley, 2016). It is a prior need and demand of an organization that teachers have subject knowledge and pedagogical skills

Research Objectives

1. To examine the perception of teachers toward the professional development
2. To examine the HRM practices for professional development at higher education institutions of Pakistan

Research Questions

1. What is the perception of teachers toward the professional development
2. What are the HRM practices for professional development at higher education institutions of Pakistan

Literature Review

The purpose of related literature review is to examine the perception of teachers toward professional development the practices of higher educational institution and the role of human resources. Review is conducted through the books, articles & research studies in the light of teachers' intension and expectation of professional development and it analyses the different models of professional development and management efforts to meet the standers of professional development. Professional development term referred as enhancement of skill and abilities for particular subject and effective & efficient role of teachers through trainings, courses and programs to meet the standers and objectives of quality education in the institution (Coetzer, 2001). Professional development is phenomenon of acquiring professional skills and knowledge which develops the career. Professional development in educational context is that teachers learn the professional abilities and behavior to achieve the academic and non-academic success in their lives (Uçar & İpek, 2019). Teachers' perception about professional development is advancement in professional knowledge and skills and effective results and responses as active learner. It was investigated the significant and values in personal, professional and knowledge skills were promoted according to need and essence of teaching (Dean, 1991; Guskey, 2000). Professional development is outstanding approach of management by which HRM department critically evaluate the existing condition teachers performance and cortically evaluates the need of professional development according to perception and expectation of teaching in order to deepen their professional knowledge and curricular instructions to meet the quality education (Desimone, Porter, Garet, Yoon, & Birman, 2002). It has briefly studied that teacher's quality performance and students' achievement is linked and interdependent. Most of the studies focus the existing education policy and practices in the light of teaching methods, performance assessment, curriculum modification & development and skills development programs of teachers in order to solve the problem of quality education (Edge,

Teachers' Perception towards Professional Development and HRM Practices at Higher Education Institutions of Pakistan

Reynolds, & O'Toole, 2015; Hilton, Hilton, Dole, & Goos, 2015) According to various studies focused the awareness and need to address the professional skills and capabilities of teachers for particular field (Bredeson, 2013). At first the need is to be identified and secondly appropriate planning for the activities for professional development to flourish their knowledge and creativity would be developed. Barnard (2004) indicates teachers are facing difficulties in the professional development; institutions do not have high consciousness about the need and importance of professional development. It is the most essential consideration about the approach of professional development which serves the role of transition in society, study focuses that researchers at universities were failed to produce knowledge and present the solution of societal problem through professional knowledge (Hargreaves, 1999).

Perception of Teachers of Professional Development

It has been deeply analyzed through various studies which focus on the professional development modals and continuous professional development, model represents the five characteristics of good professional development 1. Participative learning 2. integrity & unity 3. Skills development phase 4. Democratic vision of institution 5. Implementation of professional knowledge for the development of institution & quality education (Desimone, 2009). Institutions have paved esteem importance to quality and standards of education in past few decades. Professional expertise establishes the well flow on teacher learning process and an attractive teaching learning approach gives high performance of students through their career, it has been extremely visible that the professional growth of teachers associated with the achievement and high performance of students (Meister, 2010; Opfer & Pedder, 2011). Most of the teachers perceive that students' outstanding learning environment and achievement level greatly lay upon the skills and abilities of teachers through the professional learning and subjective knowledge. Teachers believe that it is the most important issue for the institution in advanced competitive environment to establish the quality and standard of classroom teaching learning practices which only possible through the maintenance of quality education and competent teachers and educators (Haider, et al., 2022; Palardy & Rumberger, 2008). It has become the fundamental manifestation of teachers for the academics and career inclination and security. Last couple of decades the various studies have conducted on the perception of teachers for the professional development is high priority based issue for the institutions. Furthermore it has been also found through many studies that quality education is the central agenda of the every institution and institutions are thinking for the professional activities and programs for the teachers to uplift the quality education at the end (McLaughlin & Talbert, 2006). Starkey, et al, (2009) emphasize that professional development activities and courses are most important not only for the inducted or newly recruited teachers but also for the senior teachers in order to furnish their advanced skills and professional attitude. United States has shown high serious toward the teachers perception and the need of professional development, it has conducted various studies across the US to investigate the results of professional development and access of greater resources on need based to execute the teaching learning activities, it has been concluded through the various finding that ore the teachers are skilled and professionally developed more the effective and impressive learning program would be executed in order to achieved the long and short term objectives of quality education (McCaughtry, Martin, Kulinna, & Cothran, 2006). Teachers perceived the intensive need of professional development and demanded the following professional development needs and demanded for the professional growth and development

1. Qualitative skills development trainings & courses
2. Provide platform for the higher education
3. Fair & transparent evaluation of teachers performance and skills assessment periodically
4. Provide funds and scholarships for higher education & professional development courses.
5. Availability of scientific tools and instrument and provide training to utilize them

6. Advance skills training and subject knowledge before the modification or up gradation of curriculum and policy of teaching.
7. Induction training programs and activities

Approaches of Professional Development

Professional development has two approaches 1.Traditional approach and 2. Non traditional approach, in traditional type of professional development institution facilitates the short term training session and programs to develop the teaching sense and mature whether pre service or in service but in nontraditional type of professional development the institution consistently develop the skill development sessions and activities such as coaching, skill development mentoring, pedagogical activities, assessment skills & expertise, child understanding and psychotherapy and performance assessment competencies are developed among the teachers at the end teachers are being evaluated time to time to check and evaluate the level implementation of his professional knowledge in the classroom teaching if they found any delay and obstacles in the skills finally are rectified through training and session (Özer, Doğan, Yalaki, Irez, &Çakmakci, 2021). Teacher perception for the professional development is big issue to each organization to be taken in priority consideration for the quality and reputation of the institution.

Organizational Need & Demand of Professional Development

Teaching practices and demand is growing due the advancement and modernized trends and policy in scientific education; institutions are trying to fulfill the need and demand of time according to objectives and vision of institution. It is the time when teaching and learning becomes the modern norm & value of society so institutions highly focus outcomes of learning (Fulton & Licklider, 1998). Teachers' most important duty faces the challenges of education and serve specific purpose of the institution. The major priority of the institution on effective teaching learning process, transparent evaluation and assessment, professional growth of teachers and quality education in order to attain the desired objectives of the institution meet the stander of education. Institutional management explores the needs and modern trend and promotes the professional development for innovation and change in traditional setting to accomplish the ultimate goals of the education(Atkins, Brinko, Butts, Claxton, & Hubbard, 2017).

Students Perception towards Scope of Education

As increasing diversity and multi-cultural population has different perception and need, it is facing different challenges and crises of higher education (Anderson & Kanuka, 1997). Senior learner have different perception and need of higher education and demanding diverse teaching learning strategies in order to compensate the demand of education, their learning temperament is different than junior students. It has created them the sense and maturity of professionalism and goal oriented in lives. They perceive practically involved rather than traditional involvement in learning process. This can be only possible through the professional development of faculty member to cater their needs and learning objectives(Levine, Cooper, & Hilliard, 2000). It is analyzed through the paradigm of literature review that teachers perception towards professional development is not satisfactory and demand based, most of the findings perceived that effective professional development is a big issue the practices & policies are insufficient to cater the professional need and demand of advanced teaching learning activities in higher educational institutions, teachers perception towards the role of human resources department is uncertain and insincere about the career and professional development of teachers. Researches findings believed that most of the teachers do not reach the need and demand of students learning, they are not enough skilled to understand the students perception and so that they may enhance the level of performance and achievement standards of education.

Teachers' Perception towards Professional Development and HRM Practices at Higher Education Institutions of Pakistan

Methodology

Study adopted qualitative research method and phenomenological design was used to conduct the study.

Population & Sample of Study

Population for this study was teachers and human resources management personnel of higher education institutions of Pakistan. Sample size for the prior study was 30 teachers of higher education institutions of Pakistan.

Sampling Techniques

Convenience sampling design was used for perception of teachers' professional development and HRM practices for teachers' professional development at higher education institutions of Pakistan.

Data Collection Tool & Instrument

Triangulation approach was used at first interview schedule/ protocol were prepared through which face to face semi structured interviews were conducted and transcribe the responses of participants and documents such training manual, skills development file and NOC record were analyzed.

Data Analysis

Data was analyzed in the light of paradigm perspective which includes the stories and experiences of participants. Interviews of participants was be analyzed in the Kavle's approach of analysis and interpretation of interviews and stories furthermore more documents analysis procedure is adopted for the replication and thick description of data First the sequence of thematic analysis of interviews secondly categorization and finally the significant that consecutively repeated in the interviews and scores and codes of document are analyzed and interpreted.

Thematic Analysis

Need & Demand of Teachers Professional Development in Higher Education Institutions

In the response of the respondents according to first research question of the study that what is the perception of teachers towards the professional development, most of the respondents perceived that there is profound need and necessity of teachers professional development because most of the teachers misfit in classroom teaching, uncomfortable in classroom instruction, rude and abrupt behavior with students, invalid and void practices in classroom assessment. It is explored that most of the teachers are not enough capable to understand the need, perception and attitude of students and behave ruthlessly in classroom. Respondents perceived that teaching learning process is advanced and modernized profession than all other unfortunately most of the teachers in higher education institutions are traditional in nature and their professional knowledge and skills do not meet the need of concurrent teaching learning setting. Teachers classroom style and behavior is poor and ineffective although they realize that professional skills and knowledge are utmost necessary and require for the effective teaching learning process and professional grooming, they perceived further that teachers do the meet the advance teaching skills and practices of curriculum and higher education commission Pakistan standards.

Institutional Barrier in Teachers Professional Development

Respondents perceived that teachers are facing challenges and crises in professional development such as meager number of scholarship, inadequate training and development program and restriction in permission

for professional development and higher education. Furthermore participants perceived that there is a dire need of professional development in all the aspects of teaching learning process such as delivery and methodology of lecture, classroom instructions, implementation of appropriate curriculum, skills of digital technology, evaluation and assessment process and guidance and counseling. Most of teachers are not interested for training & development and for higher education. Fees and expenses of higher education (M.Phil & PhD) are higher and less affordable for teachers and deficit in budget of Higher Education Commission Pakistan has cut short the budget of the institution there for institution could not facilitate the teachers for higher education, skill development programs and training, development sessions and short courses. Participant perceived that intuition does not provide funds and loans for professional development courses and higher education. Assessment and evaluation of teachers such as GAT, HAT & Fulbright ship GRE are quite tough and less related to teachers professional and academic domains therefore most of the teachers could not qualify it.

HRM Traditional Practices for Teachers Professional Development

In the response of the participant when they were asked according to research question second that what are the practices, policy and standard of human resources management department for the professional development of teachers most of the respondents perceived that policy and practices of professional development are poor and ineffective in quality and standard and does not meet the standards of higher education commission of Pakistan. HRM policy and practices are inadequate and traditional in nature therefore they do not cover the modern needs and demand of professional skills such modern scientific instruments and tools (projector, AVI & digital applications) are introduced in teaching learning in higher education institution but teachers do not know how to use them effectively in classroom teaching learning process. Furthermore most of the respondents perceived that teachers are not financially support and grant for higher education (Master, M.phil & PhD) institution only provides NOC and study leave which are not sufficient to encourage the professional development & higher education. It is observed through the documents analysis of human resources management department that how many teachers are supported for the higher education there were four teachers sent abroad for higher education. It is observed through the documents analysis that HRM department organizes a very few number of training and sessions for the teachers skills development which are related to proposal writing and thesis making moreover it is observed that there is now any training and session conducted for the pedagogical and assessment skills therefore teachers are direly lacking the effective and efficient method of teachers and quality base assessment skills. It is observed through the document of HRM that institution does not any policy for the short courses and skills development program for the teachers. It was analyzed the office record (documents) that human resources department has approaches and has written to higher education commission Pakistan for the induction training programs for newly recruited teachers and skills development training and program to furnish professional knowledge and expertise but due to meager funds and grants it is under process.

Poor Practices & Policy of Professional Development

In the feedback of the participants according to third research of the study teachers' that how much teachers are satisfied towards the practices and policy of professional development, teachers are dissatisfied regarding the policy and practice of HRM department towards professional development most of the participant perceived that teachers are neither encouraged and nor supported for the professional development and skills growth, most of the human resources management trainings poor in quality and do not cater the need of advanced knowledge and skills of the professions and subjects, it is observed through the document analysis that most of the master trainers were local professionals do not profound in quality of skills and knowledge about the modern skills and abilities of teaching. Most of the respondents perceived that there is lacking in meritorious approach for the equal distribution of professional developmental activities and

Teachers' Perception towards Professional Development and HRM Practices at Higher Education Institutions of Pakistan

higher educational opportunities, they perceived the element of nepotism and favor in awarding certain career based activities. Furthermore it was analyzed that there insufficient benefits and rewards for those teachers who complete short courses by themselves moreover teachers who received the highest degrees of higher education like as m.phil and PhD are not promoted according to the policy of higher education commission Pakistan. Most of the teachers are dissatisfied from the performance and practices of professional development and perceived the role of human resources department is ambiguous and ineffective to maintain the quality education in the institution and meet the modern standards and higher educational criteria in teaching learning process.

Figure 1: Teacher Perception towards Professional Development & HRM Practices for Teachers Professional Development



Findings

Analysis of this study shows that teachers' perception towards the professional development is that professional development of teachers is most important phenomenon of overall teaching learning process, and respondents perceived that there is profound need and necessity of teachers professional development because most of the teachers misfit in classroom teaching, uncomfortable in classroom instruction, rude and abrupt behavior with students, invalid and void practices in classroom assessment. Teachers' skills and professional knowledge are inappropriate and lacking in professional expertise, most of teachers do not know the modern and scientific styles and methods of teaching activities; they cannot use the scientific tools and instruments to deliver the knowledge effectively and efficiently. Human resources management practices and policy are poor and ineffective to cater the need of

teaching learning. HRM does not motivate the teachers for the professional development and skill development domain. It does not facilitate the teachers morally as well as financially for the higher education and professional courses. Ineffective policy and practices dissatisfied the need and expectations of teachers for their professional development and career growth. HRM of higher education institution does not provide skill development trainings and higher educational opportunities to teachers and HRM provided few trainings and professional development opportunities to teachers which do not cater the need of professional development and career growth for the teachers and it might not maintain the quality education in universities.

Conclusion

Teachers professional development is most important aspect of the teacher unfortunately it is under grave crises and below the standard due to poor & ineffective HRM practices & policies at higher education institutions. Teachers' professional development is badly suffered; practices and professional development opportunities do not cater the need of quality based teaching learning. Contemporary advancement in curriculum and implications of scientific methods in classroom teaching raised a big cry of teachers' professional development. HRM practices do not meet the standards of teachers' professional development and criteria of higher education commission Pakistan. Institutions only provide NOC and study leave for the higher education but there is no financial support and grant for the teachers for higher education and professional developmental courses. Institution conducted indoor trainings through the professionals of prior university which were about the proposal writing and thesis writing, project management which do not meet the standards of pedagogical principles, research skills, project management scope and assessment domains of education, moreover they remarked that those training were lacking in quality and resources for the professional development & performance management.

It found that most of the teachers are dissatisfied from the policy they perceived there is no induction training program for the newly appointed teachers although it is the policy of higher education commission Pakistan that teachers should be provided training after his appointment for the curriculum instructions, higher education code of conduct and assessment procedures (grading policy, assessment criteria and assessment tools). Furthermore found that that there is no benefits of professional development courses & higher education because institution does rewards and even teacher are not provided timely promotion therefore it discourages the teachers interest and commitment for professional development.

References

- Anderson, T., & Kanuka, H. (1997). Online Forums: New Platforms for Professional Development and Group Collaboration. *Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication*, 3(3), 112-127.
- Atkins, S. S., Brinko, K. T., Butts, J. A., Claxton, C. S., & Hubbard, G. T. (2017). Faculty Quality of Life. *To Improve the Academy*, 19(1), 323-345.
- Barnard, R. (2004). *A Qualitative Study of Teachers' Perceptions of Staff Development in Three Public North east Tennessee Elementary School Districts*. Johnson City: East Tennessee State University.
- Billingsley, B., Carlson, E., & Klein, S. (2004). The working conditions and induction support of early career special educators *Exceptional children*, 70(3), 333-347. *Exceptional Children*, 70(3), 333-347.

Teachers' Perception towards Professional Development and HRM Practices at Higher Education Institutions of Pakistan

- Bredeson, P. V. (2013). Distributed Instructional Leadership in Urban High Schools: Transforming the Work of Principals and Department Chairs through Professional Development. *Journal of School Leadership*, 23(2), 362-388.
- Burns, M., & Lawrie, J. (2015). *Where it matters most: Quality professional development for all teachers*. New York, NY: InterAgency Network for Education in Emergences.
- Coetzer, I. A. (2001). A survey and appraisal of outcomes-based education (OB E) in South Africa with reference to progressive education in America. *Educare*, 73-93.
- Dean, J. (1991). *Professional Development in School*. Maidenhead, Berkshire: Open University Press.
- Desimone, L. M. (2009). Improving Impact Studies of Teachers' Professional Development: Toward Better Conceptualizations and Measures. *Educational Researcher*, 38(3), 181-199.
- Desimone, L. M., Porter, A. C., Garet, M. S., Yoon, K. S., & Birman, B. F. (2002). Effects of Professional Development on Teachers' Instruction: Results from a Three-Year Longitudinal Study. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 24(2), 81-112.
- Edge, K., Reynolds, R., & O'Toole, M. (2015). Contextual complexity: The professional learning experiences of seven classroom teachers when engaged in "quality teaching". *Cogent Education*, 2(1), 1-15.
- Evers, A. T., van der Heijden, B. I., Kreijns, K., & Vermeulen, M. (2015). Job Demands, Job Resources, and Flexible Competence: The Mediating Role of Teachers' Professional Development at Work. *Journal of Career Development*, 43(3), 227-243.
- Fulton, C., & Licklider, B. L. (1998). Supporting Faculty Development in an Era of Change. *To Improve the Academy*, 17(1), 225-238.
- Garet, M. S., Porter, A. C., Desimone, L., Birman, B. F., & Yoon, K. S. (2001). What makes professional development effective? Results from a national sample of teachers. *American Educational Research Journal*, 38(4), 915-945.
- Guskey, T. R. (2000). *Evaluating professional development*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press.
- Guskey, T. R., & Yoon, K. S. (2009). What Works in Professional Development? *Phi Delta Kappan*, 90(7), 495-500.
- Haider, S., Anjum, T., Niazi, S., Aslam, M., Nazim, F., & Mehrukh, N. (2022). Developing Professional Competence among University Teachers in Balochistan. *International Journal of Special Education*, 37(3), 5426-5438.
- Hargreaves, D. H. (1999). The Knowledge-Creating School. *British Journal of Educational Studies*, 47(2), 122-144.
- Hilton, A., Hilton, G., Dole, S., & Goos, M. (2015). School Leaders as Participants in Teachers' Professional Development: The Impact on Teachers' and School Leaders' Professional Growth. *Australian Journal of Teacher Education*, 40(12), 104-125.
- Levine, D. U., Cooper, E. J., & Hilliard, A. (2000). National Urban Alliance Professional Development Model for Improving Achievement in the Context of Effective Schools Research. *The Journal of Negro Education*, 69(4), 305-322.

- McCaughtry, N., Martin, J., Kulinna, P. H., & Cothran, D. J. (2006). What makes teacher professional development work? The influence of instructional resources on change in physical education. *Journal of In-service Education*, 32(2), 221-235.
- McLaughlin, M. W., & Talbert, J. E. (2006). *Building school-based teacher learning communities: Professional strategies to improve student achievement*. New York: Teacher College Press.
- Meissel, K., Parr, J. M., & Timperley, H. (2016). Can professional development of teachers reduce disparity in student achievement? *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 163-173.
- Meister, D. (2010). Experienced Secondary Teachers' Perceptions of Engagement and Effectiveness: A Guide to Professional Development. *The Qualitative Report*, 15(4), 880-898.
- Opfer, V., & Pedder, D. (2011). Conceptualizing Teacher Professional Learning. *Review of Educational Research*, 86(3), 376-407.
- Özer, F., Doğan, N., Yalaki, Y., Irez, S., & Çakmakci, G. (2021). The Ultimate Beneficiaries of Continuing Professional Development Programs: Middle School Students' Nature of Science Views. *Research in Science Education*, 51, 757-782.
- Palardy, G. J., & Rumberger, R. W. (2008). Teacher Effectiveness in First Grade: The Importance of Background Qualifications, Attitudes, Instructional Practices for Student Learning. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 111-140.
- Scafidi, B., Sjoquist, D. L., & Stinebrickner, T. R. (2005). *Do Teachers Really Leave for Higher Paying Jobs in Alternative Occupations?* Ontario, Canada: University of Western Ontario.
- Starkey, L., Yates, A., Meyer, L., Hall, C., Taylor, M., Stevens, S., & Toia, R. (2009). Professional development design: Embedding educational reform in New Zealand. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 25(1), 181-189.
- Thakral, V. (2011). *Effectiveness of professional development at a primary school in Hong-Kong*. Pokfulam, Hong Kong SAR: University of Hong Kong.
- Uçar, R., & İpek, C. (2019). The Relationship between High School Teachers' Perceptions of Organizational Culture and Motivation. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 7(7), 102-116.
- Uranga, N. (1995). A Staff Development Model for a Multicultural Society. *Journal of Educational Issue of Language Minority Students*, 15(Winter), 1-10.