A Study of the Effectiveness of Authentic Materials for the Development of Higher Order Thinking Skills Amongst Undergraduate ESL Learners

Maira Mariam

Lecturer University of Central Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan

Dr. Ayesha Butt

Assistant Professor, Lahore College for Women University, Lahore, Pakistan

Dr Fakhra Aziz

Associate Professor,Lahore College for Women University, Lahore, Pakistan

Sameera Ayub Bhatti

Lecturer, The University of Lahore (Lahore School of Accountancy & Finance), Pakistan

Corresponding author email id; mairamariam@gmail.com

Abstract: The research examined the nexus and relationship between authentic materials and higher order thinking skills amongst undergraduate ESL learners. The current study directed at exploring the role and function of authentic materials as either effective or ineffective in the inculcation and activation of higher order thinking skills through the use of authentic materials Positivist approach was adopted by the researcher. The researcher adopted deductive research method design to carry out research. Research questions were devised in such a way that deeply and holistically investigated the productivity of incorporating authentic materials in English language teaching and learning process for the inculcation of higher order thinking skills. Theresearcher made use of a quantitative approach for the data collection. All the quantitative data wasanalyzed and interpreted through SPSS software. In conclusion, authentic materials can be considered as beneficial whiledeveloping higher order thinking skills amongst ESL learners.

Introduction

The current research study was executed to appraise the role of authentic materials for the development of higher order thinking skills amongst undergraduate ESL learners.

In order to succeed in this modern educational era, critical thinking skills or higher order thinking skills are required. Yee et al., (2016) propose that higher order thinking skills help the learners in fostering and developing their thinking capacity and quality which can also polish their skills,

attitudes, values, and ethics so that they may be able to apply their knowledge in order to make right decisions and solve problems.

Mursyid & Kurniawati (2019) assert that in the 21ˢᵗ century, the field of education needs the inculcation of thinking abilities which are termed as higher order thinking skills. Higher order thinking skills and "students' academic performance" have been interlinked by the experts. In relation to this, students who possess critical thinking skills perform in a much better way in academics. HOTS play an integral role in the processes of education specifically with regard to the process of teaching and learning. The learners' ability of thinking in learning can influence the fruitfulness of the process of learning. HOTS involve critical thinking skills and problem-solving skills. These thinking skills are required and demanded in current situation and settings where students are compelled to make use of their thinking capacities and abilities in order to resolve problems. For instance, students can use their thinking processes for the analysis of the information that is rampant on the internet and to choose the correct and authentic information. Students can give rise to novel and creative ideas by generating reports and sharing their findings related to different phenomenon. This is because higher order thinking skills are essential for the students. The urgent need of thinking skills has been elaborated by different experts. Students turn "self-conscious" and "self-monitoring" while they analyze different strategies to find solutions for various problems. When students are aware of "what they are learning" is related to self-conscious and self-monitoring highlights the reflection of the students in terms of their abilities and short comings while problem solving. Ability and capacity to solve the problems is that specific and urgent thinking skill that learners must learn in the current scenario.

Raja (2015) asserts that when teachers make use of authentic materials in language classrooms and display it in front of the class through the use of audiovisual aids because authentic materials are easily accessible and available and very easy to handle and they easily attract learners' attention and make involve them in executing the language task. With regards to giving instructions for different tasks and activities, exposing the learners with "linguistic input". language teachers should make use of devices such as projectors, multimedia, laptops, white board and smartboard should be used for building up and reinforcing the linguistic concepts. Authentic materials which are intended to be used in the language teaching and learning process should be screened out and filtered by the experienced language teaching professionals, experts and teachers. Linguistic knowledge, practical application of linguistic concepts, cultural insight and concepts of language learning should be enclosed within authentic materials.

According to the demand of the changing times, language teaching and learning process is also undergoing different transitions. Purnama & Nurdianingsih (2019) The metamorphosis of education has undergone a change. Teachings of Higher order thinking skills has become validated because of its key role in the field of education. Students who possess higher order thinking skills make claims that they will exceed in their educational careers and professions than those learners who possess lower order thinking skills. Students who possess higher order thinking skills are expected to be successful in study programs and educational careers. Higher order thinking skills are considered to be correlated with work readiness. Hots is sort of learning activity that is students'- centered. Constructivist learning, problem -based learning, brain storming, inquiry teaching and thinking maps are some practices that can be done while teaching of higher order thinking skills. Teaching of HOTS in relation to revised Bloom's Taxonomy involves analyzing, evaluating and creating. HOTS indicate more refined and

contextualized "context rich" thinking processes that make use of cognitive, meta cognitive, critical and reflective thinking.

Zahroh (2020) posits that higher order thinking skills facilitate learners to learn English language specifically in relation to speaking and writing skills. Students 'writing and speaking skills develop and enhance when critical thinking is integrated with language learning. Speaking and writing skills are very significant components in the domain of communication. Students get able to deliver and transfer their ideas more effectively in verbal and written forms when productive skills are combined with higher order thinking skills.

Higher order thinking skills as compared to lower order thinking skills effectively initiate thinking processes and learners can achieve high levels in thinking by arranging and relating the known information to create new things. Bastos& Ramos (2017) consider that in high schools and at college level, the emphasis is on lower order thinking skills. Students are considered to absorb knowledge and retain information just for examination point of view. Students should not be taught "what to think" rather the main target and emphasis should be on "how to think" that will make them independent, self-governed thinkers and learners. Authors are of the opinion that "According to the authors, *higher-order thinking* relates to the active and intelligent evaluation of ideas and information". So, according to Bloom's taxonomy, lower order thinking skills include memorization and recalling information while analysis, evaluation and synthesis are deemed as cognitive skills which are beyond lower order thinking skills.

Losada et al. (2016) research study maintains a point of view that the use of authentic materials created a positive impact in relation to student's enhancement at multiple levels such as learning vocabulary, cultural knowledge and their goal based on learning. Authentic materials should be integrated in an organized manner in foreign/second language situation and setting and that can be linked to teachers' knowledge, school's educational context and teaching materials. Learners' digital knowledge is created when language instructions and authentic materials are integrated with different media forms. Substantial and meaningful communicative activities take place when learners interact with other people as a result of being taught through authentic materials incorporated with media forms.

Teachers and their teaching methodologies are those essentials which can never be ignored in language classroom as these ensure the effective achievement of language teaching and learning objectives along with the development of thinking skills. Aziz et al (2017) puts forward four roles of a teachers that he/ she performs in the development and inculcation of higher order thinking skills amongst ESL learners. The first role of a teacher in relation to 'teaching for thinking' is that teachers create a classroom environment in such a way that initiates the thinking processes of learners and challenges learner's thinking power. Second role of teacher with regard to 'teaching of thinking' where teachers challenge the students by asking them a question in such a way that expects students to link their prior knowledge with new situations and settings. The next role of a teacher is 'teaching with thinking' which includes the activities which motivates and encourages students to initiate their thinking processes using the platforms of dialogues and discussion. The last role of a teacher is 'teaching about thinking' where teachers direct the students to be well aware of their thinking processes. It is obvious that the teachers should not only have the knowledge of what develops HOTs amongst learners rather a teacher should also be ready to perform multiple roles in organizing the effective implementation of higher order thinking skills in English language classroom settings.

Literature Review

Integration of HOTS in Curriculum and the Need of 21st Century Skills

Singh & Marappan (2020) reveal that education plays a vital role in the development and betterment of citizens. Teachers are expected to create a change in quality of learning through their teaching by integrating more varied approaches like inculcating higher order thinking skills amongst learners in their language classrooms. In Malaysia, Malaysian Education system has started a plan from 2013 till 2025 to integrate higher order thinking skills in the school syllabus so that it gives rise to the knowledgeable learners with critical thinking skills will be able to face the challenges at international level as well. Implementation of HOTS in the classroom setting is expected to motivate and encourage students to think critically by actively engaged in the teaching and learning process. Government, different stakeholders and teachers should collaborate in making the students competent and knowledgeable enough to compete with the changing world and its trends.

Tayas et al. (2019) propose that Indonesian ministry of education by realizing the need of 21st century skills through the implementation of the latest curriculum has integrated these 21st century skills in the language classroom setting, situations and contexts. In several new policies of education, these skills are explained and stated and one of the key policies is the implementation of that mode of learning that is based on higher order thinking skills. Transfer, critical thinking and problem-solving thinking are the three categories that together give rise to higher order thinking skills. "Transfer" expects students to not only learn the knowledge and skills but it requires the application of these learnt skills and knowledge into real life situations and settings. Critical thinking helps students in the development of decisive power, it makes the students to take decisions logically and to interpret and understand any situation with a great logical power and reason. Problem solving requires learners to find out solutions to the problems that cannot be simply solved and resolved by cramming and memorizing the content. Higher order thinking skills in relation to the mode and manner of thinking belongs to the 21st century skills.

Need to inculcate higher order thinking skills at Tertiary level

The learning of students is greatly influenced by the teaching and learning process which is conducted by the teachers in the classroom. Learning outcomes are important criterion in finding out the level of understanding and knowledge which has been gained at the completion of teaching and learning process. Learning outcomes can be seen as a form of abilities attained by students as a result of learning experience. Furthermore, the researcher asserted that the teaching and learning process at university level must integrate higher level thinking skills to inculcate critical and creative thinking amongst students. Higher order thinking skills should not only be integrated just to assess and evaluate students' learning rather it should be a part of classroom instructions as well. (Asari, 2019)

Ariska et al. (2021) propose that there is no one fixed definition of HOTS based feedback. The concept is devised by amalgamating two definitions related to HOTS and Feedback. Through HOTS based feedback, students are provided with the information related to learners' work, output and performance. Information expects students to assess, analyze and evaluate their own work and performances, the way they have done it. Students are required to produce a new and edited version of their work and performance after going through the feedback and evaluating their performances.

Presence of lower order thinking skills at textbook level

Ilma (2017) propose that higher order thinking skills are found in the book in minimum number. Textbook's thinking skills are mostly based on lower order thinking skills. Lower level of questions is usually found in the textbooks because these types of questions are easily made and devised by the teachers and textbook's authors. Students are able to answer those questions easily which are based on lower order thinking skills. Questions which are based on higher order thinking skills are rarely found in the textbooks and because these types of questions consume a lot of time in getting answered by the students. The study also indicated that sometimes teachers were unaware of the fact if the text books were designed effectively to measure students' higher order thinking skills.

Teachers' inability to produce HOTs based questions

Teachers face a lot of challenges and difficulties while creating HOTs based questions. Shafeei et.al (2017) propose that most of the teachers possess knowledge in relation to HOTs although they face difficulties in the application of HOTs due to lack of teachers' knowledge, and low proficiency levels of language learners. It is recommended that teachers should be having a complete awareness related to language learners' level of proficiency. Learners' level of proficiency determines that what type of HOTs should be kept in mind while creating HOTs based questions. HOTs based questions should be in coherence with learners' language proficiency levels and their thinking ability to process and analyze the information and to apply and use the information in real life situations as well. HOTs based question should activate students' interest and motivation as well. Language teachers should equip themselves with sufficient, adequate and necessary linguistic knowledge, pedagogical techniques and skills required in devising and implementing HOTs based questions and it can only be attained by participating in and attending HOTs based workshops and trainings programs.

Role of teachers in the inculcation of Higher Order Thinking Skills

Nagappan (2001) posits that theteachers need to allocate more time to the instructions that are related to high level and high-quality thinking by making use of various materials produced in spoken and written forms to facilitate students in the inculcation of their higher order thinking skills. In the language classrooms, teachers should go ahead and beyond teaching only receptive and productive skills. Teachers should struggle hard to equip language learners with critical and creative thinking skills. It is the need of the time that learners acquire and adopt the different types of critical thinking skills which are required to use devices and technological advancements that we come across in our daily lives and at work place used for communication purposes and other tasks. It is not stated that teachers are not using different techniques and strategies that could inculcate thinking amongst students. Teachers may be seen using different techniques and strategies to activate the thinking processes of the learners. These strategies can be used in various settings and situations and influence a wide array of cognitive processes. Although teachers are using a wide set of teaching and learning strategies but a more "powerful set of strategies" is not fully utilized. Teachers have started taking great initiatives towards the goal of development of higher order thinking skills amongst learners yet that only marks the beginning of the journey.

Statement of the problem

It has been noticed that ESL learners during the language teaching and learning process fail to process the information and to use it in the real-life context. This research has been executed to explore the reasons and factors which hold students back from processing and analyzing the information. Methods

and strategies which have been incorporated up till now to conduct English language teaching and learning process have not fulfilled the mental and cognitive needs of the language learners. At tertiary level, learners' inability to activate their cognitive patterns and to use their thinking skills has paved the way for this current research. The aftermath of cramming, rote learning and memorization at secondary and higher second level can be seen creating its drastic impact at tertiary level as well resulting in learners' lack of capacity and ability to use higher order thinking skills and to use language in real life context after processing it. This research is focused on to explore all the features and aspects involved in making the learners incapable of processing the information, using higher order thinking skills and language in real life context.

Research Questions

- What are different functions performed by authentic materials in order to develop higher order thinking skills amongst undergraduate ESL learners?
- What are ESL teachers' different opinions and point of views related to the process of language teaching and learning through the use of authentic materials in comparison to other language strategies, methodologies, practices and materials?
- What are different factors that may influence the development of higher order thinking skills through the use of authentic materials in ESL classrooms at undergraduate level?

Research Methodology

For the collection of data, to analyze and interpret the results and finding out the answers to research problems and questions, positivist paradigm provides researcher with multiple tools. The current study was based on positivist approach and followed inductive approach. For executing this research and finding out answers to research questions, researcher used quantitative method research as a strategy. To collect data, research used questionnaires with close ended items.

Study population and Sampling

All the ESL teachers teaching at Undergraduate level and all the learners enrolled in ESL degree programs at Undergraduate Level in Private sector in Lahore District were included in its study population. Through purposive sampling, the researcher selected the sample for this study. It is a type of non-probability sampling. As per the need and purpose of this current study, researcher selected the sample through the use of purposive sampling. 50 teachers took part in this quantitative data collection.

Data Collection

Questionnaire for teachers was devised with close ended items to collect data for this research. 20 items were there in the questionnaire.Teachers' questionnaire was distributed amongst 50 teachers.

Data Analysis and Interpretation

The role and usefulness of authentic materials are meant to be studied for the development of higher order thinking skills amongst ESL learners at undergraduate level. The researcher has made use of quantitative method. Tools which have been used to collect the required data are based on questionnaire comprising 20 items to get the responses of teachers which have been used to collect the quantitative data.The major purpose of the research was to investigate the effectiveness and usefulness of authentic materials for the development of higher order thinking skills amongst Undergraduate ESL Learners. Researcher intends to explore the role of authentic materials, investigate teachers' various

perspectives, and to explore and examine the challenges faced while integrating authentic materials for the development of higher order thinking skills amongst Undergraduate ESL in the Pakistani context.

This chapter deals with the analysis and interpretation of the data acquired through the data collection procedures which were questionnaires. Thequantitative analysis and discussions are used to find answers of the research questions which were constructed relying on the planned aims as well as to achieve the findings and conclusions of the current study.

The process of analyzing and discussing the results gained through the research instrument is also discussed below. The most usual and prevalent procedures for gaining descriptive information about the data of the research are the study of responses and percentages gained through descriptive statistics. The teachers' questionnaire is analyzed and discussed in the following sequence.

4.2 Teachers' Questionnaires' Analysis and Interpretation

Firstly, the results of the teachers' questionnaire were identified and specified and then analysed and discussed statistically. Findings of the Teachers' questionnaire in relation to the frequencies of the participants' responses and percentages of the close ended questions were drawn and presented by the researcher.

21 respondents (46.7%) out of 50 aged between 21-30, 20 respondents (44.4%) aged between 31-40years, 4 respondents (8.9%) aged between from 41-50 years. Most of the respondents that took part in the research study were aged between 21-30 years, see table1

Table 1 Age of Respondent

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
	21-30	21	46.7	46.7	46.7
Valid	31-40	20	44.4	44.4	91.1
	41-50	4	8.9	8.9	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Out of 45 respondents, 38 respondents (84.4%) were females, 7 respondents (15.6%) were male members. Most of the respondents in this questionnaire were female.

Table 2 Gender of Respondent

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Female	38	84.4	84.4	84.4
	Male	7	15.6	15.6	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

There were total 45 respondents, out of which 40 respondents (88.9%) were MPHIL English degree holders, and 5 respondents (11.1%) were PHD English, so most of the teachers were MPHIL English, see table 3

Table 3 Qualification of Respondent

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	MPHIL English	40	88.9	88.9	88.9
	PHD English	5	11.1	11.1	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Next, demographic information was related to experience of the respondents, so 20 respondents (44.4%) were having an experience of 5 and less than 5 years, 18 respondents (40%) were having an experience from 6-10years, 5 respondents (11.1%) were having an experience of 11-15 years, 2 respondents (4.4%) were having an experience ranging from 21-25 years. Most of the respondents were having an experience of at least 5 years. See Table 4.

Table 4 Experience of Respondent

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	5 and less than 5 years	20	44.4	44.4	44.4
	6-10 years	18	40.0	40.0	84.4
	11-15years	5	11.1	11.1	95.6
	21-25years	2	4.4	4.4	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Teachers were asked Language teaching and learning process becomes more effective when it integrates authentic materials (documentaries, articles, magazines, videos, newspaper). 15 respondents (33.3%) agreed with the statement, 30 respondents (66.7%) strongly agreed that language teaching and learning process becomes more effective and beneficial when it makes use of authentic materials, see table 5.

Table 5Language teaching and learning process becomes more effective when it integrates authentic materials (documentaries, articles, magazines, videos, newspaper).

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Agree	15	33.3	33.3	33.3
	Strongly Agree	30	66.7	66.7	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Teachers were asked if I do plan a lesson through using magazines, dictionaries, videos, you tube, and advertisements to make students categorize, analyze, justify, plan, create and construct information and language in L2 classrooms or outside classrooms, 2 respondents (4.4%) stayed neutral, 24 respondents (53.3%) agreed with the statement, and 19 respondents (42.2%) strongly agreed with the statement. So, it can be seen that teachers make use of authentic materials to prepare language teaching lesson so that the students get able to categorize, analyze, justify, plan, create and construct information and language in L2 classrooms or outside classrooms, see table 6

Table 6, I do plan a lesson through using magazines, dictionaries, videos, you tube, and advertisements to make students categorize, analyse, justify, plan, create and construct information and language in L2 classrooms or outside classrooms.

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Neutral	2	4.4	4.4	4.4
	Agree	24	53.3	53.3	57.8
	Strongly Agree	19	42.2	42.2	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Teachers were asked another question if they think that Students prefer to memorize as compared to use their thinking skills while they are learning English language. 1 respondent (2.2%) strongly disagreed, 6 respondents (13.3%) disagreed, 9 respondents (20.0%) agreed with the statement, and 11 respondents (24.4%) strongly agreed that while learning English language, learners always give preference to cramming and memorization of the content rather than making use of their thinking skills. See table 7.

Table 7 Students prefer to memorize as compared to use their thinking skills while they are learning English language.

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	1	2.2	2.2	2.2
	Disagree	6	13.3	13.3	15.6
	Neutral	9	20.0	20.0	35.6
	Agree	18	40.0	40.0	75.6
	Strongly Agree	11	24.4	24.4	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Teachers were asked the question if they make engaging lessons to involve students actively in the teaching and learning of HOTS (analysis, evaluation and creation) in the L2 classroom through authentic materials, 23 respondents (51.1%) agreed, 22 respondents (48.9%) strongly agreed. It

confirms that the teachers make the lessons in such a way that engages and involve students while the impartment of HOTS (analysis, evaluation and creation) through the use of authentic materials in L2 classrooms, see table 8

Table 8 I make engaging lessons to involve students actively in the teaching and learning of HOTS (analysis, evaluation and creation) in the L2 classroom through authentic materials.

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Agree	23	51.1	51.1	51.1
	Strongly Agree	22	48.9	48.9	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Teachers were asked if they use different strategies and techniques to teach HOTs in L2 classrooms, 2 respondents (4.4%) stayed neutral, 17 respondents (37.8%) agreed, 26 respondents (57.8%) strongly agreed. So, it is identified that for the teaching of HOTS, teachers make use of different techniques and strategies in L2 classrooms, see table 9

Table 8 I use different strategies and techniques to teach HOTs in L2 classrooms.

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Neutral	2	4.4	4.4	4.4
	Agree	17	37.8	37.8	42.2
	Strongly Agree	26	57.8	57.8	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Teachers were asked if they use authentic materials in a way that makes students analyze, evaluate and create language in the real-life contexts, 3 respondents (6.7%) stayed neutral, 21 respondents (46.7%) agreed, 21 respondents (46.7%) strongly agreed. It is concluded because of the responses that authentic materials are used by the teachers so that the students get able to analyze, evaluate, and create language in real life contexts and situations.See table 10

Table 9(a) I use authentic materials in a way that makes students analyze, evaluate and create language in the real-life contexts

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Neutral	3	6.7	6.7	6.7
	Agree	21	46.7	46.7	53.3
	Strongly Agree	21	46.7	46.7	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Teachers were asked if the factors (students, institutional and pedagogical) influence the development of higher order thinking skills using authentic materials in L2 classrooms, 4 respondents

(8.9%) stayed neutral, 19 respondents (42.2%) agreed, 22 respondents (48.9%) strongly agreed. It is stated after analyzing the responses that the development of HOTS by integrating authentic materials gets impacted because of students, institutional and pedagogical factors in Language learning classrooms, see table 11

Table 10Factors (students, institutional and pedagogical) influence the development of higher order thinking skills using authentic materials in L2 classrooms

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Neutral	4	8.9	8.9	8.9
	Agree	19	42.2	42.2	51.1
	Strongly Agree	22	48.9	48.9	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Teachers were asked if the teachers face difficulty while initiating students' thinking process through the use of authentic materials in the L2 classrooms. 3 respondents (6.7%) disagreed, 9 respondents (20%) remained neutral, 15 respondents (33.3%), 18 respondents (40.0%) strongly agreed. It is confirmed that while in language classroom when teachers are using authentic materials to initiate students' thinking process and thinking abilities; teachers face difficulties. See Table 12

Table 11Teachers face difficulty while initiating students' thinking process through the use of authentic materials in the L2 classrooms.

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Disagree	3	6.7	6.7	6.7
	Neutral	9	20.0	20.0	26.7
	Agree	15	33.3	33.3	60.0
	Strongly Agree	18	40.0	40.0	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Teachers were asked if a teacher should adapt the curriculum to the needs of students' HOTS, 1 respondent (2.2%) disagreed, 2 respondents (4.4%) stayed neutral, 25 respondents (55.6%) agreed, 17 respondents (37.8%) strongly agreed. It can be deduced after analyzing the responses that there is a need that teachers should devise and adapt the curriculum according to the needs of students HOTS and thinking abilities, see table 13

Table 12A teacher should adapt the curriculum to the needs of students' HOTS

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Disagree	1	2.2	2.2	2.2
	Neutral	2	4.4	4.4	6.7
	Agree	25	55.6	55.6	62.2
	Strongly Agree	17	37.8	37.8	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Teachers were asked that it is the duty of the teacher to know more on their own for the teaching of HOTS in the L2 classroom. 5 respondents (11.1%) stayed neutral, 23 respondents (51.1%) agreed, 17 respondents (37.8%) strongly agreed. So, it confirms that the teachers should strive to know more about the effective language teaching for the development of HOTS in the language classrooms, see Table 14

Table 13It is the duty of the teacher to know more on their own for the teaching of HOTS in the L2 classroom.

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Neutral	5	11.1	11.1	11.1
	Agree	23	51.1	51.1	62.2
	Strongly Agree	17	37.8	37.8	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Teachers were asked that to be a better teacher one needs continuous training in the teaching of HOTS in the l2 classroom, 7 respondents (15.6%), 22 respondents (48.9%) agreed, 16 respondents (35.6%) strongly agreed. It is concluded that taking continuous trainings related to the teaching of HOTS in the L2 classroom is essential for being a good teacher. See, Table 15

Table 14 To be a better teacher one needs continuous training in the teaching of HOTS in the l2 classroom

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Neutral	7	15.6	15.6	15.6
	Agree	22	48.9	48.9	64.4
	Strongly Agree	16	35.6	35.6	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Teachers were asked that if teachers evaluate and measure student's development of HOTs (analysis, evaluation and creation of language) through different tasks and activities related to magazines, newspapers, documentaries, movies, dictionaries to teach language use in L2 classroom. 9 respondents (20.0%) remained neutral, 21 respondents (46.7%) agreed, 15 respondents (33.3%) strongly agreed. Responses of this statement confirm that teachers monitor and traces out students' development of HOTS and thinking abilities through giving them different tasks from authentic materials such as magazines, newspapers, movies, documentaries and dictionaries for teaching language for communication purposes in L2 classrooms. See table 16

Table 15Teachers evaluate and measure student's development of HOTs (analysis, evaluation and creation of language) through different tasks and activities related to magazines, newspapers, documentaries, movies, dictionaries to teach language use in L2 classroom

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Neutral	9	20.0	20.0	20.0
	Agree	21	46.7	46.7	66.7
	Strongly Agree	15	33.3	33.3	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Another statement was that if students prefer to be taught through text books and traditional methods of language teaching as compared to be taught through authentic materials and innovative teaching strategies , 1 respondent (2.2%) strongly disagreed, 20 respondents (44.4%) disagreed, 7 respondents (15.6%) stayed neutral, 9 respondents (20.0%) agreed, 8 respondents (17.8) agreed. It can be deduced that students do not prefer traditional methods and text books over authentic materials and innovative teaching strategies in language classrooms, see table 17

Table 16Students prefer to be taught through text books and traditional methods of language teaching as compared to be taught through authentic materials and innovative teaching strategies

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	1	2.2	2.2	2.2
	Disagree	20	44.4	44.4	46.7
	Neutral	7	15.6	15.6	62.2
	Agree	9	20.0	20.0	82.2
	Strongly Agree	8	17.8	17.8	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Teachers were asked if traditional teaching methods and text books are more focused towards language teaching. 2 respondents (4.4%) strongly disagreed, 15 respondents (33.3%) disagreed, 10 respondents (22.2%) stayed neutral, 14 respondents (31.1%) agreed, 4 respondents (8.9%) strongly agreed. Most of the respondents do not consider the use of traditional methods and textbooks asmore focused towards language teaching. See table 18

Table 17Traditional teaching methods and text books are more focused towards language teaching

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	2	4.4	4.4	4.4
	Disagree	15	33.3	33.3	37.8
	Neutral	10	22.2	22.2	60.0
	Agree	14	31.1	31.1	91.1
	Strongly Agree	4	8.9	8.9	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Teachers were asked that different teaching resources, media, and materials are provided in L2 classrooms, 2 respondents (4.4%) strongly disagreed, 2 respondents (4.4%) disagreed, 4 respondents (8.9%) stayed neutral, 23 respondents (51.5%) agreed and 14 respondents (31.1) strongly agreed. It is stated after analyzing the responses that teachers are provided with various teaching resources, materials and information communication tools in their language learning classrooms, see table 19

Table 18Different teaching resources, media, and materials are provided in L2 classrooms.

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	2	4.4	4.4	4.4
	Disagree	2	4.4	4.4	8.9
	Neutral	4	8.9	8.9	17.8
	Agree	23	51.1	51.1	68.9
	Strongly Agree	14	31.1	31.1	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Teachers were asked if teaching language through authentic material is useless if the teaching content is not age, level, needs and class appropriate, 6 respondents (13.3%) disagreed, 5 respondents (11.1%) answered neutral, 14 respondents (31.1%) agreed, 20 respondents (44.4%) strongly agreed. It is concluded that language teaching and learning is ineffective if the authentic materials which are used in this process are not according to the age, level, needs and content, see table 20

Table 19Teaching language through authentic material is useless if the teaching content is not age, level, needs and class appropriate

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Disagree	6	13.3	13.3	13.3
	Neutral	5	11.1	11.1	24.4
	Agree	14	31.1	31.1	55.6
	Strongly Agree	20	44.4	44.4	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Another question which was asked does the innovation (the process of making changes to something established by introducing something new) or the tasks based on using varied approaches such as using authentic materials help the learners in developing thinking skills and to use language in the real world? 1 respondent answered neutral, 29 respondents (64.4%) agreed, 15 respondents (33.3%) strongly agreed. It is identified after analyzing the responses that different approaches, varied tasks and activities facilitate the learners in the inculcation of thinking skills and use of language in real life context, see table 21

Table 20Does the innovation (the process of making changes to something established by introducing something new) or the tasks based on using varied approaches such as using authentic materials help the learners in developing thinking skills and to use language in the real world?

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Neutral	1	2.2	2.2	2.2
	Agree	29	64.4	64.4	66.7
	Strongly Agree	15	33.3	33.3	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Teachers were asked if students are able to analyze articles from the internet in English language classrooms, 1 respondent (2.2%) strongly disagreed, 4 respondents (8.9%) disagreed, 11 respondents (24.4%) answered neutral, 23 respondents (51.5%) agreed, 6 respondents (13.3%) strongly agreed. It is confirmed that whenever students are assigned task to analyze the articles from the internet, they are able to analyze and review it in language classrooms, see table 22

Table 21Students are able to analyze articles from the internet in English language classrooms.

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Strongly Disagree	1	2.2	2.2	2.2
	Disagree	4	8.9	8.9	11.1
	Neutral	11	24.4	24.4	35.6
	Agree	23	51.1	51.1	86.7
	Strongly Agree	6	13.3	13.3	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Next question which was asked that students are better able to give reasons and justify their answers with solid arguments when they gather information through newspapers, magazines, reports and articles etc. 1 respondent (2.2%) disagrees, 5 respondents (11.1%) answered neutral, 30 respondents (66.7%) agreed, 9 respondents (20.0%) strongly agreed. It is deduced after analyzing the responses that whenever students are given a task in language classrooms to gather information through different authentic materials such as newspapers, magazines, reports, articles students are able to use the language content in their writing after processing the information and they are able to justify their answers by giving logic, reasons and justifications, see table 23

Table 22Students are better able to give reasons and justify their answers with solid arguments when they gather information through newspapers, magazines, reports and articles etc.

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Disagree	1	2.2	2.2	2.2
	Neutral	5	11.1	11.1	13.3
	Agree	30	66.7	66.7	80.0
	Strongly Agree	9	20.0	20.0	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Another statement was advertisements, documentaries, and different materials on the internet help students in initiating their thinking process. They are able to create and construct ideas and things on their own after taking help from authentic materials, 1 respondent (2.2%) disagreed, 4 respondents (8.9%) answered neutral, 24 respondents (53.3%) agreed and 16 respondents (35.6%) strongly agreed. It is concluded that different available and appropriate materials on the internet helps in the inculcation and activation of learners thinking skills and processes. Language learners can give rise to different constructs, notions, ideas and create various things by taking help through authentic materials. See table 24

Table 23Advertisements, documentaries, and different materials on the internet help students in initiating their thinking process. They are able to create and construct ideas and things on their own after taking help from authentic materials

		Frequency	Percent	Valid Percent	Cumulative Percent
Valid	Disagree	1	2.2	2.2	2.2
	Neutral	4	8.9	8.9	11.1
	Agree	24	53.3	53.3	64.4
	Strongly Agree	16	35.6	35.6	100.0
	Total	45	100.0	100.0	

Conclusion

It can be concluded that the use of authentic materials makes the ESL learners to develop higher order thinking skills so that they are able to categorize, analyze, justify, plan, create and construct information and to produce and use language not only in classroom settings but in the real-life context as well. It is observed that it is the responsibility of the teachers to take initiatives in order to make language teaching and learning process more thought provoking and interactive for the students. Learners have been considered more enthusiastic about getting taught by authentic materials as compared to traditional teaching methodologies and materials in ESL classrooms. It is identified that teachers have been appreciated by the language learners for the use of authentic materials to develop higher order thinking skills. With reference to responses of the respondents, role of teacher has been considered vital in making the language teaching and learning process more fruitful by incorporating innovative learning strategies and experimenting new techniques that make the language learning process more productive. The study found out that the role of textbook in language teaching and learning process cannot be ruled out completely by the integration of authentic materials in L2 classrooms. Due to the prevalent examination system, in some instances, memorization is still deeply rooted in the fabric of language learning process as compared to the use of cognitive and thinking abilities. Language teaching and learning process becomes more effective by the use of authentic materials only if these learning materials are age, context, culture, content, need, students' interest and level appropriate. With reference to current study, authentic materials have been identified as a source to develop higher order thinking skills and cognitive abilities to a great extent amongst ESL learners at undergraduate level.

References

Ariska, R., Gustine, G. G., &Setyarini, S. (2021, April). Promoting Students' Higher-OrderThinking Skills Through Teacher's Feedback in an EFL Classroom. In *Thirteenth Conference on Applied Linguistics (CONAPLIN 2020)* (pp. 471-478). Atlantis Press.

Asari, Salamet.(2019). Fostering Students' High Order Thinking Skills through the Use of Interpretation Cards. *International Journal of Education & Literacy Studies*, 7(4), 17-18. http. DOI: 10.7575/aiac.ijels.v.7n.4p.17

Aziz, A. A., Ismail, F., Ibrahim, N. M., &Samat, N. A. (2017). Investigating the implementation of Higher Order Thinking Skills in Malaysian classrooms: Insights from l2 teachingpractices. *Sains Humanika*, 9(4-2).

Bastos, A., & Ramos, M. A. S. (2017). Higher-Order Thinking in Foreign Language Learning. *Advances in Social Sciences ResearchJournal, 4*(5) 90-118

Ilma, Faradina. 2017. *Higher Order Thinking Skill Questions in Reading Exercises: AnAnalysis   of   Reading   Exercises   in Bright Course Book for the Seventh Grade of Junior High   School   of 2013 Curriculum*. Erlangga, 2017.

Losada, C., Insuasty, E., & Osorio, M. (2016). The impact of authentic materials and tasks on students' communicative competence at a Colombian Language School. *Teachers'   Professional Development*, *19*(1),89. https://doi.org/10.15446/profile.v19n1.56763

Mursyid, M., &Kurniawati, N. (2019). Higher order thinking skills among English teachers across   generation   in EFL classroom. *English Review: Journal of English Education*, *7*(2), 119   124.

Nagappan, R. (2001). Language teaching and the enhancement of higher-order thinking skills. *Anthology series-SEAMEO regional language centre*, 190-223.

Oguz, A., &Bahar, H. O. (2012). The importance of using authentic materials in   prospective   foreign language teacher training. *Pakistan Journal of   social sciences*, *5*(4), 328   336.

Purnama, Y. I., &Nurdianingsih, F. (2019). The impact of Higher Order Thinking Skills   (HOTS)instructions in teaching EFL speaking skill

Raja, M. S. H. (2015). Relevance of authentic materials to the attention span of adult   learners in English language classes in Pakistan. *NUML Journal of Critical   Inquiry*, *13*(2), 50.

Shafeei, K. N., Hassan, H., Ismail, F., & Aziz, A. A. (2017). Incorporating higher order   thinking skill (HOTS) questions in ESL classroom contexts. *LSP International Journal*, *4*(1).

Singh, C. K. S., &Marappan, P. (2020). A review of research on the importance of higher order   thinking skills (HOTS) in teaching english language. Journal of Critical Reviews, 7(8), 740-747.

Tyas, M. A., Nurkamto, J., Marmanto, S., &Laksani, H. (2019). Developing higher order thinking   skills (HOTS)–Based questions: Indonesian EFL teachers' challenges. In *Proceeding of   the 2nd International Conference on Future of Education* (Vol. 2, No. 1, pp. 52-63).

Yee, H. M., Lai, S. C., Tee, K. T., & Mohammad, M. M. (2016). The role of higher-order thinking   skills in green skin development. *Matec Web Conferences*, 70, pp. 1-5. doi:10.1051/mate cconf/20167005001

Zahroh, S. (2020). Integrating higher-order thinking skills (hots) to increase students'   productive skills. *International journal of social science and humanity*, 1-12.