

Kickpatrick Model Evaluation on Education with Specialization on Women and Children Services

1st Halimah, 2nd Suparno Eko Widodo & 3rd Sarkadi

Education Management Pascasarjana, Universitas Negeri Jakarta, East Jakarta, Indonesia

* Corresponding autho: halimah_7617168421@mhs.unj.ac.id

Received: 14th September -2021

Revised: 07th November 2021

Accepted: 08th November 2021

Abstract: An increasing number of violence againts woman and children cases, has been responded by the Indonesian National Police with the establishment of Women and Children Service Units. In order to further develop the ability of human resources in the units, the personnel are trained in the education specialized on women and children services (Dikbang PPA). However, there has been no evaluation about the effectiveness of the education program. This study aims to provide an evaluation on the Dikbang PPA using Kirkpatrick training evaluation model. The subjects of the study are policewomen, facilitators and organizers of the program. Data are collected by distributing questionnaires, conducting observations and interviews, and studying documentation. This study uses descriptive analysis qualitative data, interpret the data with each of the component that are evaluated in comparison with pre-determined criteria. This study found that the implementation of the In-Special Education for Women and Children Service Unit Officers is in accordance with the environmental needs of the participants that work as investigators of criminal offences experienced by women and children in their units. The stages of training activities for both participants and facilitators are running well and can be classified in good category. At a later stage, we can see the behavioural changes of participants as the impact of training. They also applied the behaviour in their workplaces. The impact of changes, in the context of the behaviour of the participants, in fact increases the level of customers' confidence and satisfaction..

Keywords: Kickpatrick Model, Evaluation, Services

1. Introduction

The importance of conducting a study of an evaluation programs of Specialization development education of Women and Children Services (Dikbangpes PPA) can be identified from the following points. First, there is an increasing number of violence againts woman and children cases. In 2008, there were 1,736 cases of child abuses were reported to the National Commission for Child Protection. That number increased in 2009 to 1,998 cases of violence against children, and around 62.7 percent of the cases involved sexual violence. In 2010 about 453 were physical violence, out of 646 sexual violence and 550 including psychological violence, 69 kidnapping cases and 30 pornography cases. Throughout 2015, the National Commission on Child Protection has recorded 2,508 cases of violence against children. This figure increased when compared to 2014, which was 2,413 cases. 1,020 or equivalent to 62.7 percent of the total number was cases of sexual violence committed in the form of sodomy, rape, sexual abuse and incest, and the rest is physical and psychological violence. Likewise, there is number of cases of children dealing with the law. Throughout 2015, the National Commission on Child Protection received 1,851 complaints of children in conflict with the law (children as perpetrators) which were submitted to the court. This figure increased compared to complaints in 2014, which was 730 cases. Nearly 52 percent of this figure was theft, followed by cases of violence, rape, drugs, gambling, and ill-treatment and almost 89.8 percent of cases of children dealing with the law end in criminal conviction or convicted. (Komnas perlindungan anak)

Based on Komnas Perempuan's 2017 Annual Compass Records, there were 245,548 cases of violence that occurred in Indonesia in 2016 from 358 Religious Courts and 233 cases of violence in 34 provinces recorded that there were 13,602 cases handled by Service Procurement Partners. From the data, 259,150 cases of violence against women occurred in Indonesia. According to Yohana Yembise the Minister of Women's Empowerment and Child Protection stated that in March 2018 there were around 1,900 reports of violence against children in Indonesia. The number of cases of violence that occurred so that the need for public awareness to report the perpetrators of crime. Sindo, "Report on Violence against Children Increases in 2018", (Sindo News, March 19, 2018,).

The formation of the Women's and Children's Services Unit (PPA), initially in the service of women and children was previously handled in the Special Examination Room (RPK) which was established in 1999, Based on the Chief of Indonesian National Police Regulation number 10 year 2007 (Peraturan Kapolri No. Pol.: 10 Tahun 2007) concerning the Organization and Work Procedure of the Women's and Children's Services Unit (PPA Unit) within the Republic of Indonesia National Police on July 6, 2007 The RPK was renamed the Women's and Child Service Unit (PPA Unit). This change aims to deal with cases related to women, children can be handled more optimally, and the protection of women and children's rights can be fulfilled.

In its development in handling cases of violence against women and children, there are still many obstacles that must be overcome, for example the number of female police investigators for PPA units is still inadequate, both in terms of quantity and in terms of quality. In terms of quantity, due to the limited number of police officers, there are still PPA offices that are manned by male police, in terms of quality there are still PPA investigators who have not yet participated in the Specialization Development Education for Women and Children Services Unit (Dikbangpes PPA). Therefore, the National Police Education Institution organizes an annual PPA. Participants of the Dikbangpes PPA are all women, who have fulfilled the requirements to become investigators.

Second, Meyer and Smith (2000) in Elnaga (2013: 142) emphasized that in order to improve the knowledge, skills and abilities of an organization's personnel so that they can do their jobs well, an excellent and professional educational and training institution is necessary for the institution to be able to produce human resources (HR) that are competent, have positive attitude and behaviour, are committed, and have high work motivation. Third, the Specialized Developmental Education for each personnel can improve his or her performance in the organization through the increased motivation and high commitment. Fourth, in this context, organization educates and develops Human Resources so that they can enhance the organizational effectiveness. The effectiveness of the Dikbangspes PPA is an important factor in developing an organization's human resources. Nevertheless, it is not enough to just provide development education to the personnel, the organization has also to conduct an evaluation to find out whether the development education that the personnel participate in has effectively met the organization's expected result.

This research questions include: According to the Kirkpatrick training program evaluation model (Reactive, Learning, Behavior, Results) : How do the participants React to the Specialization Development Education of Women and Children Services ?, How does the Learning process of the Specialization Development Education of Women and Children Services run ?, How do behavior changes run after taking the Specialization Development Education of Women and Children Services ? and How does the Specialization Development Education of Women and Children Services result influence the implementation of duties?

2. Method

This study used a qualitative research, an evaluation study which is oriented to see the effectiveness of the program and the suitability of the results of Specialization Development Education of Women and Children services (Dikbangspes PPA) at the Mega Mendung Detective Training Center Jalan Megamendung No. 1 Cipayung Jawa Barat. in Bogor, West Java. This research has been conducted from April to Juni 2020. The basis of activities in the evaluation of this training program will be reviewed from the levels of reaction, learning, behavior, and results. The reason of using the four levels of training evaluation in this study is because this model is suitable for evaluating programs training and widely used.

The research subjects consist of respondents and informants, who are all of the participants of the Specialization Development Educational of women and children services Year 2019 (25 participants) . The informants of this study include: (1) Students of the the Dibangspes PPA, Year 2019; 25 personnel; (2) Head of the Criminal Investigation Education and Training Center, leaders and educators, instructors and facilitators in the Criminal Investigation Education and Training center. (3) Head of the Education and Training Development Bureau, as an element of leadership assistant and implementation staff under the Head of National Police Education and Training (Kalemdiklat Polri), as the organizer of Education and Training within the National Police Educational and Training Agency (Lemdiklat Polri) environment;

Data collection for this research is based on levels. On the stage of reaction, the level of satisfaction of the participants is measured using questionnaires, observations and interviews. In order to measure the level

of learning processes experienced by the participants, the researcher employs written forms such as pre-test, post-test and interviews. In order to measure the behaviour changes, the researcher employs observations and interviews. In order to measure the result of the program, the researcher employs observations, interviews and working reports.

3. Findings and Discussions

3.1. Findings

This stage of evaluation is carried out to find out how the findings of the training affect the work environment of the trainees. To measure this stage, researchers conducted interviews with supervisors from trainees that is, about the effects of the training, which were directly, felt and felt very useful in carrying out daily tasks. By following this education, it increases the trust of superiors, so that superiors are more confident and trusting in the ability and skills of personnel in carrying out the tasks assigned to them.

The evaluation of findings, which aims to determine the impact of changes in work behavior of participants on the agency or organization. Aspects that can be seen include improving the quality of work; reducing the level of error both in quality and quantity, and the level of user confidence in this case the work unit (Satker) where they work is increasingly confident and trusting. The interview results show that there is an increase in the level of trust of users, in this case the Satker.

The background of the participants more or less influenced the process of transfer of knowledge and skills in, the Specialization Development Education of Women and Children Services program. When viewed from an educational background it is concluded that the average participant's education is high school. Because when the participants first register to join the Policewomen Requirements, they initially use a high school diploma and after the discussion, participants are encouraged to continue their formal education to a higher level of education.

The Specialization Development Education of Women and Children Services evaluation process was carried out according to Kirkpatrick's 4-Stage Evaluation Theory: the reaction stage, the learning phase, the behavior stage and the outcome phase. With the following results:

3.2. Discussion

1) Reaction Evaluating

In the first stage, namely Reaction, the evaluation was conducted with the aim of measuring the level of participant satisfaction with, the Specialization Development Education of Women and Children Services. The components included in this reaction stage are the content and design of the program, facilitators, and training facilities.

a) Training program content and design

Program content and design are materials related to the handling of cases relating to women and children. From the results of the questionnaire, information was obtained about the participants' understanding of the objectives of the Specialization Development Education of Women and Children Services. The results of the questionnaire showed that the participants understood the objectives of the Development Education Specialization of Women and Children Services. The questionnaire results showed 36.67% of the participants understood the objectives very well. 53.33% of participants understood the objectives of the program well and the remaining 10% of participants understood the objectives of the training program. Meaning generally, participants understand the purpose of holding the training program well. The suitability of the material with the objectives and training topics is one indicator to measure participant satisfaction with the implementation of the training program. The participants' reactions to the suitability of the training material with the objectives and topics, as well as the needs of the work environment.

It was seen that 15.00% of the participants strongly agreed that training materials were needed in their work. The number of participants who agreed was 55.00% and 27.14% of the participants considered the training material to be ordinary. In addition, no one disagrees that training material is not needed in his or her work.

The level of participant satisfaction was very high for the media used in the training program (4.23 or 84.67% of the maximum percentage score). The media used are audio visual media, such as power point presentations, and some interesting pictures and videos related to the training material.

The suitability of the training time was also felt by both participants, both in terms of the timing of the training, and the schedule of training events that had satisfied the participants' satisfaction. The value of 3.82% or 76.43% of the maximum score, meaning that the participants' satisfaction was high with the program's implementation. In this Dikbangspes, participants are provided with accommodation in the form of a room / flat / dormitory. The class schedule starts at 7.30 WIB until 14.30 WIB. Every day from Monday to Friday. The training schedule prepared by the organizers was considered quite well by the participants, as evidenced by 55.00% of the questionnaire values agreed with the suitability of the training time. However, many participants suggested adding extra practice time especially in training to solve problems in the form of cases of violence against children and women.

b) **Facilitator**

The next component in the reaction stage is the facilitator, which is measured as indicators of the suitability of the facilitator's expertise with the material area, the ability to communicate with participants in the delivery of material, the facilitator's skills in engaging participants to participate.

Facilitators are experts in their fields, judging from their educational background, all facilitators come from the National Police Education and Training Center and Bareskrim as the functionaries of the Women and Children Services Unit PPA Unit. Educators or instructors are quite senior and have a lot of experience in the field of education and teaching, and have received special training in handling cases of violence against women and children

Kickpatrick Model Evaluation on Education with Specialization on Women and Children Services

Each facilitator has his own way and art in the delivery of material in accordance with the knowledge and experience during their service. In general, a high level of participant satisfaction was seen from the results of the participant questionnaire, but there were a number of things that became a participant's complaint, namely the lack of facilitator's ability to open material presentations and many stories about experiences during the ministry. It is expected that the facilitators or instructors will be given special training before they become facilitators or instructors to be more professional in providing education in accordance with the requirements of educators at the National Police Education Training Center, namely at least Bachelor Degree graduates. Sometimes the presentation seems monotonous and the mastery of the material is still poor and lacks of mastering pedagogic science

Participants felt that 40.83% of the facilitator's ability to communicate was good, even 4.17% of the participants thought the facilitator could communicate very well with the trainees and the remaining 40,83% average, 10% poor,4,17% very poor. This ability is supported by the experience of each of the facilitators who have served long enough as investigators in the area and as educators in educational institutions.

If seen from the results of the participant questionnaire, the assessment of the facilitator in terms of the way the material was presented was 3.84 or 76.80% of the maximum score. This means that the facilitator presents the material well, so participants understand and like it. The assessment of the ability to communicate with participants during the presentation of the material also showed a good value, namely 3.98 or 79.67% of the maximum score. Because the facilitator has often been the Specialization Development Education of Women and Children Services instructor, he or she has long served and has a lot of experience in his field of work.

This was also shown by a number of participants in an interview excerpt, "Very good and funny too and entertaining members depends on ideas from the instructor to entertain participants and attract our attention (participants), so that when he/she gives the material a lot of questions ... so exciting, continue to teach the practice is also patient and passionate, the others too ... ". The passage reinforces the results of the questionnaire that 75% stated that the material given by the facilitator was done attractively.

Reaction phase evaluation aims to find out the level of satisfaction of the trainees with the training. Evaluation at this stage is an evaluation of the training process itself. The quality of the process or implementation of a training can be measured through the level of participant satisfaction with the implementation of a training.

Training participants' satisfaction with the organization or process of a training will have direct implications on the motivation and enthusiasm of learning during the training program. The trainee will learn better, when they are satisfied with the atmosphere and environment in which they work. Professional instructors, adequate and complete supporting facilities as well as the cohesiveness, enthusiasm and motivation of the trainees is one of the keys to the success of the training that was held.

Knowing the level of participant's satisfaction can be done by measuring several aspects in the organization of the training. These aspects include program content, facilitators and training facilities. In this, the Specialization Development Education of Women and Children Services program, the level of

participant satisfaction with the organization of the training was 4.23 or 84.67%. That is, participants feel satisfied with the organization of the training program as a whole.

c) **Training facilities**

Indicators for training facilities include the availability of adequate classrooms, room temperature, and tools used for practice. From observations made by researchers and interviews conducted with the Head of Gadik District as, the Specialization Development Education of Women and Children Services organizer that classrooms, chairs, desks and other devices are particularly adequate.

There were some participants who suggested that training facilities be improved and equipped for the success of the next, the Specialization Development Education of Women and Children Services .

Training Schedule is arranged by the organizer. The time used for training is 8:00 a.m. to 2:00 p.m. In terms of learning facilities, bro, all the equipment and tools are available and quite adequate. Conformity between the media and the material field taught and able to support the process of delivering the material by the facilitator. The equipment provided by the organizer is good, consisting of a laptop, LCD, screen, projector, whiteboard, stationery, and a complete sound system. Before the material begins, each participant gets a pen and notebook.

The training lasts 1 (one) month, every day from 8.00 to 16.00. From the observations of researchers, for consumption participants get one break by drinking aqua and snacks around 10:00. Therefore, that when viewed in terms of consumption and complete administration is quite satisfying and supported. Participants' assessment of training facilities was good with a mean value of 3.31 or 66.17% of the maximum score, meaning that participant satisfaction was high. In addition, there are those who suggest increasing their practice time and instructors and others are feeling good enough,

2) **Evaluating Learning**

In the second stage of learning, an evaluation is conducted to find out how far the impact of the training program that participants participated in improving knowledge, skills and behavior from the data obtained by comparing the measurement results before and after the training. The background of the participants more or less influenced the process of transfer of knowledge and skills in, the Specialization Development Education of Women and Children Services program. When viewed from an educational background it is concluded that the average participant's education is high school. Because the requirement when the participants first register to join the Police women , they initially use a high school diploma and after the discussion, participants are encouraged to continue their formal education to a higher level of education, due to their busy work in the ministry. Many do not have Bachelor Degree (S1).

Participants who have an educational background Bachelor Degree amounted to 2 people or 10% of the total participants. While those with a high school education background numbered 18 people or 90%, with the high school majority background , it can be concluded that the ability to absorb training material is very good. This will make the learning process faster.

The process of , the Specialization Development Education for Women and Children Services program begins with a telegram from the HR of the National Police Headquarters. After that each Satker proposes its members to take part in the Specialization Development Education for Women and Children Services through a warrant (SP), based on that SP the member can participate in, the Specialization Development Education for Women and Children Services program which will be held by the Police Education and Training Center. The training program began with an opening ceremony, which was attended by senior staff of the Indonesian Police Education and Training Service Training Center, PJU and the facilitator or instructor of National Education Training and Training Center Training Center and the participants. After finish the opening ceremony it will be continued with the Chief's hour. Before the facilitator delivered the material, participants were given an oral pretest or practice to find out the initial ability of the training program. Participants for, the Specialization Development Education for Women and Children Services Presentation of material is divided according to sessions or subjects that will be taught every day.

Based on observations made by the author in the field and interviews conducted with participants and facilitators, it is known that there is an increase in knowledge and skills after they follow the learning. It can be concluded that there has been a learning process for trainees with an average value of 7.47 with good results. Causing their knowledge and skills to increase. The results of the practical test also showed the process of mastering the knowledge and skills of the participants during the exercise.

The evaluation of the learning phase, this is important because without the learning process there will be no significant changes in the behavior of the training program participants. One of the goals of learning is to increase the knowledge that we can see before and after the training program, showing that there is a learning process to find out how far participants understand the knowledge and skills of participants that have been learned from the training program. The results obtained through the training will measure the skills that participants have learned during the training program.

The results or training scores of participants showed a significant increase, the average results were in the range of 7.47. The writer's observations and interviews conducted with trainees, superiors, coworkers and facilitators showed changes and increased knowledge and skills of participants during the training program.

The skills taught during the training program have made changes and increased the knowledge of trainees in a good direction.

3) Evaluating Behavioral

Evaluation at this stage is carried out to find out whether new skills, knowledge or behavior as a result of training, are really utilized and applied in their daily work behavior according to their workload. To measure success at this stage the researcher again held interviews with participants' supervisors and coworkers.

Interviews were conducted after the training program was completed. From interviews with participant coworkers, information was obtained that there were changes in positive behavior, which was the result of, the Specialization Development Education of Women and Children Services.

The evaluation of the work behavior of the trainees after returning to their work environment. Behavior here is work behavior that is directly related to the training program material are changes in attitudes, improvements in knowledge and / or added skills of the participants during the training program implemented in the participant's work environment or are they allowed to settle inside the participants without ever being implemented.

Evaluation of this behavior can be done through direct observation into the work environment of trainees. Besides, it is also through interviews with supervisors and co-workers of the training participants.

With these things, it is hoped that changes in behavior of trainees will be known before and after participating in the program. Training participants need a transition time in changing their work behavior after participating in the program, so it is strongly recommended that the conduct of this behavior evaluation be carried out by first giving a break time for the transition period. The results of interviews conducted with participants' supervisors and coworkers showed a change in the behavior of participants in their work environment.

The knowledge and skills provided in this training program are very important and are needed by all, Women and Children Services Unit Investigators, as Women and Children Services Unit investigators whose cases of violence against women and children increase every day. Measuring the behavior of participants in the work environment in this study is rather difficult; because it is very rare, something goes wrong, and it can even be said never. The things learned in the training are to anticipate situations or events that are not desired by all parties, namely mistakes in carrying out procedures to deal with victims, witnesses and perpetrators of violence against children and women. So that researchers look at the behaviors of prevention and anticipation to deal with tasks that are also learned during the training program runs.

From the results of interviews and observations, obtained information that participants implement the knowledge gained in the work environment after the training was held and showed excellent performance, and can apply all of their knowledge and skills.

4. Conclusion

Based on the results obtained in the study, the following conclusions can be concluded: Reaction level Participants understand the objectives of, the Specialization Development Education of Women and Children Services program and feel that the material provided in the training is in line with the participants' expectations. In addition, the material provided is also needed in the participant's work environment. The training facilitator has a background of experience and education that supports and is an expert in the field. Submission of material and ways of communicating with participants are quite good, so participants feel comfortable during the training program. The facilities and infrastructure supporting the training are very good. Overall, the results of the measurement of the level of participant satisfaction with the organization of the training were 4.23 or 84.67%. So it can be concluded that the participants were very

satisfied (Value 4.01 - 5 The value of participant satisfaction was high towards the implementation of the training program)

Learning Phase , The learning process that took place during the training showed good results, seen from the results of the test participants, as well as the results of interviews with the facilitator. So the average value is 7.47%. This illustrates the increase in knowledge of training participants. Increased knowledge experienced by the participants showed that the transfer learning process in the second stage was successful.

Measuring behavior is not as simple as the previous two stages, the reaction stage and the learning stage. First, participants do not change their behavior until they get a chance to do what they have gained during the training. In this case, the material provided so that researchers cannot assess changes in participant behavior until a problem occurs or they are carrying out a task.

As with the behavioral stage, the evaluation results phase is also the stage to be measured. Evaluations for the behavioral stage and the outcome phase can be seen after the training is finished. In determining the results obtained from this training, it must start by looking at the results, evaluation in the previous stage, namely the behavioral stage. In the previous stage, it was concluded that participants had changed their behavior according to the knowledge and skills gained during the training. The success of the training program is also demonstrated by the increased ability and expertise to complete the work.

REFERENCES

- Abdulghani, M., H., Shaik, A., S., Khamis, N., Al-dress, A., A., Irshad, M., Khalil, S., M., Alhaqwi, I., A., & Isnani, A. (2014). *Research Metodology Workshop Evaluation Using the Kirkpatrick's Model: Translating Theory Into Practice*. Informa UK Ltd, Doi: 10.3109/0142159X.2014.8860 12.
- Alipour, M., Salehi, M., & Shahnava, A. (2009). A study of on the job training effectiveness: Empirical evidence of Iran. *International Journal of Business and Management*, 4(11), 63-68.
- Borate, N., Gopalkrishna, D., Shiva Prasad, H. C., & Borate, S. (2014). A case study approach for evaluation of Employee Training effectiveness and Development program. *The International Journal of Business & Management*, 2(6).
- Caro, C. A. (2011). Predicting state police officer performance in the field training officer program: What can we learn from the cadet's performance in the training academy?. *American Journal of Criminal Justice*, 36(4), 357-370.
- Creswell, J. W. (2012). *Research design Pendekatan kualitatif, Kuantitatif dan Mixed; Edisi Ketiga. Cetakan II*. Diterjemahkan oleh: Achmad Fawaid. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.

- Devi, Rama. V., & Shaik, N. (2012). Evaluating training & development effectiveness-A measurement model. *Asian Journal Of Management Research*, 2 (1), 722-735.
- Elnaga, A., & Imran, A. (2013). The effect of training on employee performance. *European Journal of Business and Management*, 5(4), 137-147.
- Holton, F., Elwood. (1996). The Flawed Four-Level Evaluation Model. *Human Resource Development Quarterly*; Spring 1996; 7,1 : ProQuest Health Management. Hlm.5.
- Kirkpatrick DL (1978), Evaluating in-house training programs. *Training and Development Journal*, 38, pp 32-37.
- Kirkpatrick, D. L., Kirkpatrick. J. D. (2001). An Excerpt from *Evaluating Training Programs: the Four Levels*. Berrett-Koehler Publishers.
- Kirkpatrick, D. L., & Kirkpatrick, J. D. (2006). *Evaluating training programs: The four levels*. Berrett-Koehler Publishers.
- Kissack, H. C., & Callahan, J. L. (2009). The reciprocal influence of organizational culture and training and development programs: Building the case for a culture analysis within program planning. *Journal of European Industrial Training*, 34(4), 365-380.
- Komariah, A., & Triatna, C. (2005). *Visionary leadership menuju sekolah efektif*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Kunche, A., Puli, R. K., Guniganti, S., & Puli, D. (2011). Analysis and evaluation of training effectiveness. *Human Resource Management Research*, 1(1), 1-7.
- Maduka, C. E. (2014). The Impact of Training in the Nigerian Police Force: A Study of Zone 9 Umuahia. *The International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities Invention*, 1(5), 326-343.
- Mellahi, K. (2000). Human resource development through vocational education in Gulf Cooperation Countries: The case of Saudi Arabia. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 52(2), 329-344.
- Prabawati, I., & AOktariyanda, T. (2018, January). Competency-based training model for human resource management and development in public sector. In *Journal of Physics: Conference Series* (Vol. 953, No. 1, p. 012157). IOP Publishing, 1-7.
- Praslova, L. (2010). Adaptation of Kirkpatrick's four level model of training criteria to assessment of learning outcomes and program evaluation in higher education. *Educational Assessment, Evaluation and Accountability*, 22(3), 215-225.
- Rafiq, M. (2015). Training Evaluation in an Organization Using Kirkpatrick Model: a Case Study of PIA. *J Entrepren Organiz Manag* 4:151. Doi: 10.4172/2169-026x.1000151.
- Ramadhon, S. (2016). Penerapan Model Empat Level Kirkpatrick Dalam Evaluasi Program Pendidikan Dan Pelatihan Aparatur Di Pusklat Migas. *Swara Patra*, 6(1).

Smidt, A., Balandin, S., Sigafoos, J., & Reed, V., A. (2009). The Kirkpatrick Model: A Useful tool for evaluating training outcomes. *Journal of Intellectual & Developmental Disability*, September 2009; 34(3): 266-274. DOI: 10.1080/13668250903093125.hal. 272

Steensma, H., & Groeneveld, K. (2010). Evaluating a training using the "four levels model". *Journal of Workplace Learning*, 22(5), 319-331.

Arikunto, Suuharsimi. *Educational Program Evaluation* (Jakarta: PT. Bumi Aksara, 2009), p. 53.

Kirkpatrick, D.L. *Evaluating Training Programs*, San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler Publisher, 1996.

Kirkpatrick, DL, James D. *Implementing the Four Levels, A Practical Guide for Effective Evaluation of Training Programs* (San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler Publisher, 2007).

Mutrofin. *Program Evaluation, Preferred Text for Beginners*. Yogyakarta: Laks Bang Pressindo, 2010.

Steers, R. M., and L. W. Porter. *Motivation and Leadership at Work*, 6 th ed. New York: Mc. Graw Hill, 1996.

Spaulding, Dean T. *Program Evaluation in Practice*. USA: PB Printing, 2008.

Siagian, Sondang. *Human Resource Management, Leadership and Administrative Behavior*. Jakarta: Publisher Bumi Aksara, 1994.

Tole, Daniel. *Evaluation*, www. Unicef.org/rosa/ROSA_Evaluation_journal.pdf. Accessed June 10 2019.

W.b. Wether Jr., and Keith Davis, *Human Resource and Management Personnel*, Fifth Edition (Mc. Graw Hill, Inc., 1997), p. 290

Worthen, B.R. (2001). "Whither Evaluation? That All Depends ". *American Journal of Evaluation*. Vol. 22 (3), 409-418.

Young, G. (2006). "Evaluation of Can Cross the Boundaries: The Case of Transport Canada". *Canadian Journal of Program Evaluation*. Vol. 21 (3), 73-92.

(<http://yusrantamar.blogspot.com/2012/04/unit-pelayanan-perempuan-dan-anak-ppa.html> Patriarchal versus Feminist Legal Culture in Law Enforcement in the Case of Violence Against Violence.pdf. (n.d.).

