

Ethical Philosophy of Islam and role of education Management of Ethics in Pakistan a Critical Analysis

1st Dr Naseem Mahmood, 2nd Dr Irum Sultana, 3rd Dr Abdul Aleem, 4th Dr Maria Mann, 5th Dr Hafiz Muhammad khan, 6th Dr Shabbir Hussain

1. Assistant Professor Govt Allama Iqbal Graduate College for Boys Sialkot
2. Assistant Professor, National University of Modern Languages Islamabad
3. Associate professor, Head Department of Islamic Studies Govt Jinnah Islamia Graduate College Sialkot
4. PhD Scholar Mohi-ud-din Islamic University Nerian Sharif AJ&K Pakistan
5. Associate professor Department of Islamic studies Mohi-ud-din Islamic University Nerian Sharif AJ&K Pakistan
6. Associate professor Department of Islamic studies Mohi-ud-din Islamic University Nerian Sharif AJ&K Pakistan

* Corresponding author: drnasimskt@gmail.com

Received: 07th July 2021

Revised: 21st August 2021

Accepted: 03rd September 2021

Abstract Ethics is the basic need of every nation. It shapes the behavior and personality of a living being. Islam is a significant religion because of its moral standards. Modern-day Pakistan is suffering from infinite worldly challenges. To combat them, moral education is very necessary which should be initiated since schooling. Education is the key element that contributes to developing the state. It assists every being to lead the financial rank of the country towards a prosperous future. In the preamble of Pakistan, it is mentioned that however, the sovereignty is the attribute of Almighty Allah only across the whole cosmos, also the mandate practiced by the nation of Pakistan by keeping in consideration the boundaries set by Allah is a sacred belief. This study is thus set to compare the moral standards established by Quran and Sunnah in Islam and following of those moral values by the nation of Pakistan by analyzing the role of educational institutions of Islamic republic of Pakistan.

Keywords: *Ethics, philosophy, education, Islam, Pakistan.*

Introduction

Every religion has its own set standards of moral values. And the nations following those religions follow that standards. These standards establishes a distinctive image among different religions and thus different nations. Every nation is recognized by the traditions and rituals they practices. and those rituals and traditions are the consequence of the moral values that have been particularized by the religion they follow. However, the prevailing phenomenon of globalization, modernism, and westernization has impacted the

moral standards of around every nation. The race of coping the capitalism of leading states has made the developing states their slave. Education at schools and likewise institutions plays an important role in transferring the moral teachings to its followers. This study is based on qualitative research approach. Comparative study has been conducted to analyze the moral teachings of Islam and the following of those teachings by Pakistanis through educational systems. The Holy Quran and Ahadith-Sayings of Hazrat Muhammad Mustafa SAWW are used as the primary sources for detailed description of concept of Moral standards in Islam. While various journal articles are used as secondary sources to survey the literature regarding the concept of culture of Moral education in Islam. Furthermore, the survey studies conducted by various channels have also been added to assist our study regarding the moral educational input and output of Pakistan. Surveillance of the literature is employed as a research tool for this study. Furthermore, this study is embellished with the author's opinions and point of view in this regard. Findings of the conducted research as well as suggestions are provided for the development of morality in Pakistan for its progress as a nation. Conclusively, outcomes of the research are mentioned at the end.

Novelty of concept

Morality is a standard of personality facets possessed by a single person, a clan, or a whole nation in comparing evil and good; though, education is known to be the pivotal attribute for the moral satisfaction of the nation together with the societal well-being in which the people resides. Islam teaches a comprehensive life-style, entails a detailed moral framework which is a significant element of its global image. We are residing in the era in which right and wrong are mostly considered as related notions. The moral framework of Islam is remarkable in this regard, it not just describes moral values, but leads the whole humanity to attain it also, at the personal and communal level as well. In Quran Allah has said:

O mankind, indeed, we have created you from male and female and made you peoples and tribes that you may know one another. Indeed, the most noble of you in the sight of Allah is the most righteous of you. Indeed, Allah is Knowing and Aware.¹

The moral framework of Islam is originated from its basic doctrine of believing in the sovereign Allah being the Creator as well as Upholder of the whole universe, describes the universal basic rights and principals for every human, under the lights of which actions are categorized as moral or maybe immoral. In Islam, the ideology of "Taqwa" refers to the set of moral values which inspires the behavior of human and connotes the ethical impression which raises the awareness in the human about their responsibility towards Allah and the state. The good means of serving the humanity in the best way is to educate them. Even, the first revelation of Quran started with the term "Iqraa" which means "Read"!

Recite in the name of your Lord, who created²

Also, Quran tells:

¹ Quran; Surah al-Hujarat, verse 13

² Quran; Surah al-Alaq, verse 1

Is one who is devoutly obedient during periods of the night, prostrating and standing [in prayer], fearing the Hereafter and hoping for the mercy of his Lord, [like one who does not]? Say, "Are those who know equal to those who do not know?" Only they will remember [who are] people of understanding³.

At another place in Quran, Allah stated:

So high [above all] is Allah, the Sovereign, the Truth. And [O Muhammad], do not hasten with [recitation of] the Qur'ān before its revelation is completed to you, and say, "My Lord, increase me in knowledge."⁴

Moreover, there are several sayings of Hazrat Muhammad SAWW regarding education, He SAWW stated; "Acquiring education is compulsory for every Muslim man and woman"; "Pursue knowledge, from cradle to grave"; "Pursue knowledge even if you have to go to china".

Objectives

Fundamental aims of this study includes:

- Comprehensive analysis of moral values in Islam
- Exploration of culture of moral education in Pakistan
- Comparative analysis amidst moral teachings of Islam and implementations of those teachings in Pakistan

Ethical Philosophy in Islamic management System

In Islam, ethics refers to the idea of justice, strong conduct, and the set of moral attributes and values defined in Islamic texts. The basic concept and objective of morality in Islam is love: the love for Allah and His creatures. The religious belief is that in order to please Allah, humanity would act responsibly and treat one another in the best way possible. Morality and ethical values are heavily emphasised in Islamic literature. The prime source for such teachings is Qur'an and Ahadith that are the Islam's basic religious scriptures. Both Qur'an and Ahadith constantly urge Muslims to be morally correct. The most stressed moral values in the Qur'an are empathy to others and also compassion to the weak and needy. Helping those in need, forgiving people's mistakes, respecting the elderly, keeping promises, being compassionate to humans and also animals, being courteous in distress, upholding justice, being trustworthy, and suppressing one's rage are all significant values in the Islamic philosophy of morality.

Key Features

³ Quran; Surah az-Zumar, verse 9

⁴ Quran; Surah Taha, verse 114

The Qur'an and Sunnah stand as essential basis for moral teachings in Islam. Other origins of moral and religious instruction include the contributions of Islamic historians and thinkers, as well as the moral standards set by prominent Islamic leaders (like the four caliphs of Islam).

Ethics as Basic Code of Conduct

Islamic scholars have also given extensive discussions and guidance on ethical values. One common Islamic religious principle is that placing a punishment on a criminal proportionate to their offence is acceptable and fair, but sparing the perpetrator is preferable. Going an extra mile and doing a favour for the perpetrator is considered the standard of greatness. Another fundamental idea is that whatever is healthy and advantageous to society is morally correct, and vice - versa. According to Shari'ah, a Muslim is only supposed to behave in a decent way, as unrespectable manners win evil. Hazrat Muhammad Mustafa SAWW once said: "You cannot participate in ridiculing and scorning and be virtuous at the same time".

Themes

In Islamic culture, establishing good moral ideals has received a lot of recognition. Without a sense of justice, faith is deemed insufficient. In Shari'ah, a follower who lacks morality is regarded as having refused to acknowledge the true meaning of faith. In other terms, prayers that cannot prevent an individual from crime are considered meaningless. Hazrat Muhammad Mustafa SAWW has stated: A real poor person is somebody who will arrive on the Day of Judgement with a bunch of rewards received due to his prayers, fasting, and zakaat, yet who has also harmed someone, wrongly charged someone, unlawfully taken someone's assets, and killed someone; so, all his goods will be awarded to the affected people, and he will be sent to hell⁵. According to Islamic culture, moral values and positive conduct raise a man's dignity. Since the attainment of moral character is person's own choice, their implementation lies under the heading of morally obligatory worshipping and is perceived as the path to gaining God's closeness. Hazrat Muhammad Mustafa SAWW said: "The best of you are those with the best conduct and personality."⁶

Character Building and Ethics and Morality

Behavior is primarily defined as the collection of characteristics that differentiate one person from another. Behavior can be both good and evil. A good behavior is the one that holds positive moral values. Early Islamic intellectuals discussed whether behavior could be modified. They acknowledged the dual feature of behavior - inherent and learned - and therefore stated that it could be modified to some extent by deliberate practice.

Islam encourages the concept of moral character, as shown by its sacred scriptures. The Qur'an defines the character of Hazrat Muhammad Mustafa SAWW as having "esteemed character":

*And indeed, you are of a great moral character.*⁷

and calling him "an outstanding example":

⁵ Sahih Muslim, 32:6251

⁶ Sahih al-Bukhari, 8:73:56

⁷ Quran; Surah al-Qalam, verse 4

Surely there was a good example for you in the Messenger of Allah, for all those who look forward to Allah and the Last Day and remember Allah much⁸.

It essentially means that Muslims must observe and develop ethical and religious standards of Hazrat Muhammad Mustafa SAWW in order to build a morally decent behavior. Muslim intellectuals have debated the ethical and religious significance of developing a positive character, and how to develop it. According to Imam Birgivi, "combating yourself against an evil behavior is a duty." Continuously practising moral virtue and a genuine attempt to internalize certain virtues will result in the development of a morally positive character. According to Al-Isfahani, soul purification involves regulating, rather than suppressing impulses. Most of Muhammad's sayings emphasize the value of having a strong character.

- According to Anas ibn Malik, Holy Prophet (PBUH) stated: "The one with strong values and behavior already possesses the most of this world and the world hereafter"⁹.
- Abu Hurayrah claimed that the Last Messenger (PBUH) said, "I have been assigned for character refinement"¹⁰.
- According to Anas ibn Malik, Muhammad (PBUH) said: "A soul attains the highest and most valued levels in the world Hereafter because of the good behavior." A person's evil behavior leads them to the lowest pits of Hell¹¹.
- One could repent for his/her sins except for bad behavior – as a person commits a worse sin before trying to seek forgiveness for one¹².

Ethics in Education Management in Pakistan

The successful achievement of moral responsibility is essential to continuum of the social development. Nationals continue to collaborate with one another. Hatred, as well as financial gain, induces bargains that end in the deprivation of other individual rights. People obsessed with specific goals and those with the inherent proclivity to destroy and steal exist in every culture. These characteristics do not contribute to the prosperity of the population. The origin of values in Pakistani society exists in certain personalities, localities, or people who affect our quality of life at different levels and thus facilitate us in the adoption and implementation of moral values. Parents, social circles, young people, opinions, activities, textbooks, newspapers, academic institutions, seminars, teaching habits, and forums on moral standards are some of the origins of promoting moral values. As a kid's first educational institution, his parents play a crucial role in establishing his or her character. Parents are the children's mentors throughout the earliest stages of life. Parents display their attitudes and behavior towards their children. Parents educate their children correct manners in everyday life, such as how to greet friends, honor

⁸ Quran; Surah al-Ahzab, verse 21

⁹ Tabarani and Abu Dawud

¹⁰ Imam Ahmad and Bayhaqi

¹¹ Tabarani

¹² Tabarani, Isfahani

elders, love younger siblings, walk, speak, conduct regular practices, and execute other duties in the best way. Parents are there to show their kids the distinction of good and evil. They are the builders and organizers of their children's personality, ensuring that they have good thoughts, solid character and positive attitudes and are also helpful to everyone. Furthermore, they teach their kids the significance of behavior, self-respect as well as self-esteem.

In Pakistan, the last official survey was held in 1998. Following that, only demographic estimates for different purposes were made. According to the most recent survey, there are around 52.9 million children who are in their school age (5-16 years) in Pakistan, out of a populace of about 200 million (over 25 percent). Just 27.89 million children go to schools (public and private), while 25.02 million kids are not attending any school (OOSC)¹³. Pakistan has the 3rd largest percentage of female children who are out of schools, with girls accounting for 55 percent of all OOSC. The latest female gross enrolment at primary school level is 64%, in comparison to 72% for male contemporaries. There is a significant regional imbalance in offering girls' equal educational facilities. Nationwide, 15.9 million males under the age of 16 are admitted in educational institutes, compared to a total of 11.9 million students. However, 13.7 million females and 11.4 million males are not attending educational institutions¹⁴. According to a study reported in Spatial Knowledge and Information Management (SKIM), nearly one in every five-primary school - age children is out of school, and this ratio rises as levels of education rise. Balochistan has the largest percentage of OOSC by country, accompanied by the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA). Punjab however has more than half of the whole percentage of OOSC. The statistics also show vast social differences in offering equal rights for girls to attend school, with the province of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa having the largest difference. Access to education is much harder in remote regions for both males and females, and the number grows at higher educational levels. Additionally, children from underprivileged backgrounds are more frequently absent from school than children from wealthy backgrounds¹⁵. There have been two significant education reform developments over the last two centuries: The National Education Policy of 1998-2010 as well as the National Education Policy of 2009. Despite the fact that the National Education Policy (NEP) 2009 discussed all significant aspects of learning and anticipated strategic steps and ambitious priorities, no framework was put in place to monitor its execution. As a result of the 18th Amendment of the Constitution in 2010, which shifted schooling to the provinces, the legislative forum for administrative cooperation arrangements within the provinces for public education vanished or was diminished. Subsequently, this significant policy— NEP 2009—remains a guide and basis of

¹³ Alif Ailaan. (2014). 25 Million Broken Promises: The crisis of Pakistan's out-of-school children. Alif Ailaan, Islamabad. ISBN 978 969-23023-0-2. https://d3n8a8pro7vhmx.cloudfront.net/alifailaan/pages/540/attachments/original/1422009988/Alif_Ailaan_report_25_million_broken_promises.pdf?1422009988.

¹⁴ Riazul Haq. (2014). Gloomy Picture: 25 m children out of school says new report. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/779119/gloomy-picture-25m-children-out-of-school-says-new-report/>.

¹⁵ Rajper, R. (2015). The sorry state of education in Pakistan. In S. Ahmed (Ed.) *Spatial knowledge and information management (SKIM)* (No. 2, pp. 16-19). Islamabad: Alhasan Systems Private Limited

direction for policymakers and education administrators at different levels across the world¹⁶. Fortunately, in September 2013, the Pakistani government issued a National Plan of Action 2013–2016 to enhance advancement towards education specific strategies and initiatives specified by MDG/EFA for 2015-2016. The main goal of NPA was to increase momentum in reaching education specific MDGs over the next three years. The Plan clearly targeted at: growing children's enrollment in early schools; raising attendance at the primary school level and fulfillment of early education for all children in schools; and facilitating early education efficiency¹⁷. Nevertheless, due to numerous pressures and government agendas, the proposal was unable to proceed. In Pakistan, poor leadership in the educational system is a big impediment. District and regional education officials and administrators lack the necessary experience, determination, and inspiration, and they require high-quality training. Deficiency of school supervision personnel, partly caused by budgetary pressures and in particular by recruiting strategies, has led to inconsistent and limited delivering services by teachers and administrators within schools. Public involvement in school issues is often ineffective, resulting in a failure to control academic performance. Similarly, over the last century, Pakistan has seen a spike in agitation and aggressive militancy, particularly in northern areas. Education systems, specifically girls' institutions in remote regions, have been attacked and demolished on a daily basis. In comparison, violence towards young girls has grown drastically. As a consequence, parents have been deterred from sending their children, especially girls, to school¹⁸. Terrorist groups have increasingly targeted mixed-gender schools and colleges, raising security risks. The curriculum is important in developing students' minds and aiding them in attaining their full potential. It defines the peoples' fundamental philosophies and knowledge. Needless to say, what is learned in Pakistani educational institutions falls short of the expectations set by developing countries. It continues to emphasize traditional styles and approaches that are no longer in use in the modern world. The textbooks must clearly convey in order to address all of the targets while still arranging the material in a rational, concise, and engaging way. Furthermore, several textbooks lack self-test questions and exercise pages¹⁹. In Pakistan, there seems to be an immediate need to introduce scientific learning, innovative technologies, engineering, and statistical education at the elementary and secondary schools through Inquiry Based Science Education (IBSE). Following the events of 9/11 in the U.S in 2001, Pakistan's madrassas have come under international enquiry. Since then, all acts of global terrorism, have been traced to Islamic jihadism. Scholars also established opposing views on Madrassas. Madrassas, according to one party, are “jihad centers having little to do with learning but more to do with brainwashing; nurseries of Islamists extremists; roots of radical violent agendas, and hence a security danger to the western world.” The

¹⁶ Bhatti, M. A., Bano, S., Khanam, F., & Hussain, A. (2011). Problems in the Implementation of National Education Policies (NEPs) at elementary level. Academy of Educational Planning and Management (AEPAM), Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan, Islamabad.

¹⁷ Alam, M. (2014). A policy note on “Universal Primary Education in Pakistan” national and provincial progress towards Universal Primary Education MDGs targets, Challenges and Possible Solutions. Public Policy Note 05/2014, Institute of Public Policy, Beaconhouse National University.

¹⁸ MET&SHE. (2014). Education for all 2015—National review report: Pakistan. Ministry of Education, Trainings and Standards in Higher Education.

¹⁹ Rajper, R. (2015). The sorry state of education in Pakistan. In S. Ahmed (Ed.) *Spatial knowledge and information management (SKIM)* (No. 2, pp. 16–19). Islamabad: Alhasan Systems Private Limited

other community of academics predicts madrassas as performing productive roles in the society, such as growing literacy rates, promoting religious morals and human ideals, creating room for society's oppressed groups, discouraging crime, and thereby sustaining civil order²⁰. Instead of learning algebra, science, and literature, children spend a considerable amount of their time reciting religious scriptures that they do not comprehend²¹. The education learned in madrassas does not steer young and inexperienced minds towards productive thinking. Improper education, as well as society's disapproval of madrassas, may inspire youth extremism. Examining the curriculum of madrassas clearly exposes discrimination and raises questions about the path Pakistan has taken. Students devote a most of their time in reciting religious texts, singing war songs, and honouring the nation²².

Recommendations

Islam do encourage learning, education as well as knowledge. However, there are some agencies who pretending to be true practicing Muslims tends to devastate the learning institutions, like that of the armed forces, girls' schools and colleges, and mosques as well. The incident of Malala Yousafzai along with her other partners together with the assassination of Shuja Khanzada- Home minister of Punjab, in Attock along with several other mishaps in the neighboring states like Afghanistan includes youngsters in the terror attacks, which are not coming to an end, though the Government has been making very hard efforts to combat such incidents. It is just because of the fact that we as a nation lack proper moral educational system. In Pakistan, quality as well as standard of education is highly compromised. Another major problem is the issuance of bogus degrees and certifications. Several studies have reported the low standards of education, irresponsible attitude of teachers and phantom educational institutions. It is well-known ideology that low-standard or lack of education, discrepancies in the distribution of wealth and biased societal norms are among the fundamental immoral societal attitude of youngsters and their leaders. As the syllabus of the Madrasahs, is probably not steering the delicate as well as young brains in the direction of constructive and progressive philosophy; as an alternative, Madrasahs preaches the discrimination among different communities, particularly in contradiction to the religious matters, that is how prompting revengeful attitude in them. Pakistan is going through the phase of resoluteness wherever camaraderie,

²⁰ Butt, T. M. (2012). Social and political role of Madrasah: Perspectives of religious leaders in Pakistan. *South Asian Studies*, 27(2), 387-407.

²¹ Ahmed, D. (2015). Can fundamentalism in Pakistan be traced back to Madrasah?

²² Kamal, S. (2014). Madrasah education: A threat to peace and tolerance

cohesion, and reciprocal-collaboration are highly essential. Educational system is the highly recommended source of reconstruction and re-analyzation of the ideologies and behavior to construct a well-organized nation relevant to the moral framework of Madinah.

Several suggestions have been recommended for Pakistan in the light of the moral standards set by Islam.

- Resistance, tranquil conjunction, positive impression of Pakistan on the foundation of web-based media like twitter, Facebook and so forth, and concordance among various beliefs ought to be advanced.
- Teaching of morals is definitely not the one-day task, as Hazrat Ali RA has said that from the time of birth up to the age of 7 years, child should be left free to do anything he or she wants to do. However, for the next 7 years, they should be watched and treated critically, as this period of time plays a significant role in the development of moral personality of a child.
- Once the child approaches the age of joining a school, their educational institution must be chosen very peculiarly, and parents should keep an intensive check on their school-related activities and regular discussion sessions with their teachers should be conducted, so that they may know in what environment their children are spending most of their time.
- Subjects identified with moral and moral codes ought to be made piece of the educational programs from nursery to PhD level. This is on the grounds that the qualities exist all over. Likewise, they are exceptional in each family. Reasonableness, generosity, empathy, trustworthiness, respectability, resistance, and regard are the qualities bestowed to the adolescent through instructive areas. Our qualities are clear in our activities, practices just as inactions.
- Parents are encouraged to add to instruct their kids with moral exercises.
- National foundation of morals and morality should be set up as it is a significant necessity of the new occasions. This establishment is expected to give nitty gritty information with respect to the moral philosophy of Islam for building a tranquil society.
- Teaching of morals is an absolute necessity in each association comprehensive of branch of police, government officials, public, and government workers too.

Conclusion

Humanity is closely connected morally with Allah. However, in the world of capitalism, everyone connects itself with many other things inclusive of community, family, parents, country etc. and with each passing stage, new connections take the place in our life. Islam encourages a strong kinship among brothers. It greatly emphasizes upon tolerance, humility, civility, and patience with other fellows. These moral attributes are significant for peaceful existence of humanity. In accordance with the Islamic teachings about moral standards and values being human is to observe closed connectedness as well as communal empathy, and it is very important. Every person is accountable for the rights of its fellow beings. The educational institutions particularly religious educational institutions are considered to have played a negative role in the bringing up of young minds. Rather than focusing on the science subjects and true essence of Islamic moral teachings, the mentors there prompt extremism in them, and due to this thing, our youngsters are found involved in terror activities. Also, the female education is highly compromised. "Give me an educated

mother, I shall promise you the birth of a civilized, educated nation", said Napoleon Bonaparte in the 18th Century. In addition to the Quranic texts and saying of Hazrat Muhammad Mustafa SAWW, education for females has greatly been emphasized by the western scholastics as well.

References

- Quran; Surah al-Hujarat, verse 13
Quran; Surah al-Alaq, verse 1
Quran; Surah az-Zumar, verse 9
Quran; Surah Taha, verse 114
Sahih Muslim, 32:6251
Sahih al-Bukhari, 8:73:56
Quran; Surah al-Qalam, verse 4
Quran; Surah al-Ahzab, verse 21
Tabarani and Abu Dawud
Imam Ahmad and Bayhaqi
Tabarani
Tabarani, Isfahani
Alif Ailaan. (2014). 25 Million Broken Promises: The crisis of Pakistan's out-of-school children. Alif Ailaan, Islamabad. ISBN 978 969-23023-0-2. https://d3n8a8pro7vhmx.cloudfront.net/alifailaan/pages/540/attachments/original/1422009988/Alif_Ailaan_report_25_million_broken_promises.pdf?1422009988.
Riazul Haq. (2014). Gloomy Picture: 25 m children out of school says new report. <http://tribune.com.pk/story/779119/gloomy-picture-25m-children-out-of-school-says-new-report/>.
Rajper, R. (2015). The sorry state of education in Pakistan. In S. Ahmed (Ed.) *Spatial knowledge and information management (SKIM)* (No. 2, pp. 16–19). Islamabad: Alhasan Systems Private Limited
Bhatti, M. A., Bano, S., Khanam, F., & Hussain, A. (2011). Problems in the Implementation of National Education Policies (NEPs) at elementary level. Academy of Educational Planning and Management (AEPAM), Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan, Islamabad.
Alam, M. (2014). A policy note on "Universal Primary Education in Pakistan" national and provincial progress towards Universal Primary Education MDGs targets, Challenges and Possible Solutions. Public Policy Note 05/2014, Institute of Public Policy, Beaconhouse National University.
MET&SHE. (2014). Education for all 2015—National review report: Pakistan. Ministry of Education, Trainings and Standards in Higher Education.
Rajper, R. (2015). The sorry state of education in Pakistan. In S. Ahmed (Ed.) *Spatial knowledge and information management (SKIM)* (No. 2, pp. 16–19). Islamabad: Alhasan Systems Private Limited
Butt, T. M. (2012). Social and political role of Madrasah: Perspectives of religious leaders in Pakistan. *South Asian Studies*, 27(2), 387–407.